1 Chromium speciation in foodstuffs: a review

- 2 Elliott M. Hamilton¹, Scott D. Young², Elizabeth H. Bailey², Michael J. Watts^{1*}
- 3 ¹Inorganic Geochemistry, Centre for Environmental Geochemistry, British Geological Survey,
- 4 Environmental Science Centre, Nottingham, UK, NG12 5GG.
- ²Centre for Environmental Geochemistry, School of Biosciences, University of Nottingham, Sutton
- 6 Bonington Campus, Sutton Bonington, Leicestershire, UK, LE12 5RD.

7 Keywords

8 Chromium, speciation, foodstuffs, review, hexavalent

9 **Highlights**

- A comprehensive review of chromium speciation in foodstuffs is presented in this article
- Cr(VI) concentrations from off-line extraction and analytical techniques should be questioned
- 12 Isotope dilution techniques can monitor species interconversions during extraction
- New speciation techniques should also focus on the measurement of Cr(III)

14 Abstract

- Numerous critical reviews have evaluated exposure to toxic and carcinogenic hexavalent chromium
- 16 (Cr(VI)) from a number of pathways; including workplace air, cement and packaging materials. The
- 17 contribution of foodstuffs to dietary Cr(VI) has been increasingly under investigation, however no
- summary of this work has been carried out. The objective of this article is to review the last twenty
- 19 years of chromium speciation research in foodstuffs. Alkaline extraction, used for chromium
- speciation in other solids, is the most widely-reported procedure. Previous measurement of Cr(VI) in
- 21 foodstuffs is questionable due to the reducing power of organic matter and antioxidants, leading to
- 22 the development of speciated isotope dilution mass spectrometry (SIDMS) techniques to monitor
- 23 interconversions. Evaluation of the genotoxicity of trivalent chromium (Cr(III)), which acts through a
- 24 different pathway to that of Cr(VI), requires reconsideration towards measurement of Cr(III), which
- 25 is present at higher concentrations in foodstuffs following reduction of the more-bioavailable Cr(VI).

26 1.0 Introduction

27 <u>1.1 Background</u>

- 28 Chromium (Cr) is a transition metal that exists in the environment as Cr(III) (trivalent) and Cr(VI)
- 29 (hexavalent) forms. These naturally occurring oxidation states differ significantly in their mobility,
- 30 bioavailability and toxicity (Oliveira, 2012). Trivalent Cr is present as cationic species and is
- 31 considered to be essential for insulin regulation and glucose metabolism (Office of Dietary
- 32 Supplements: National Institute of Health, 2013), whereas Cr(VI), which is largely anthropogenic in
- 33 origin and exists as anionic species, is toxic and a known carcinogen through inhalation (McCarroll,
- 34 Keshava, Chen, Akerman, Kligerman, & Rinde, 2010). The EH40/2005 Workplace Exposure Limit
- 35 (WEP) assigned for Cr(VI) is 0.05 milligrams per cubic metre of air averaged over an 8-hour period
- 36 (Health and Safety Executive, 2013). However, there is evidence of genotoxicity of Cr(III) compounds

- 37 (Fang, Zhao, Zhen, Chen, Shi, & Huang, 2014); their use in nutritional supplements has been the
- 38 subject of a number of research articles (Bailey, 2014).
- 39 The main applications of Cr are in the metallurgical and tanning industries (Stasicka, 2000). Owing to
- 40 its hardness and resistance to corrosion, Cr is used to anodise aluminium (Kendig, Jeanjaquet,
- 41 Addison, & Waldrop, 2001), as an additive in primer paint for aerospace and automobile refinishing
- 42 (Basketter, Slodovnik, Merimes, Trattner, & Ingber, 2000), and in the production of steel and alloys
- 43 (Dhal, Das, Thatoi, & Pandey, 2013). Trivalent Cr salts are used to tan leather by cross-linking
- 44 collagen fibres (Brown, 1997). In the United States, the mineral crocoite (PbCrO₄) was used as a
- 45 yellow pigment for school buses because it does not degrade in light and has a strong colour, but
- 46 this has declined due to environmental concerns over its disposal (Gettens, 1966). Lead chromate
- 47 was historically used as a food adulterant to bulk flour and enhance the yellow colour in turmeric
- 48 (Ellis, Brewster, Dunn, Allwood, Golovanov, & Goodacre, 2012). Chromium-containing pesticides,
- such as chromated copper arsenate, were utilised in the timber industry (Hingston, Collins, Murphy,
- 8 Lester, 2001), although their use in the UK has been highly restricted since 2004 (Mercer &
- 51 Frostick, 2012). This widespread use has led to concern over Cr(VI) pollution of the environment (A.
- 52 M. Zayed & Terry, 2003). Chromium is one of four priority soil-metal contaminants for the U.S.
- 53 Department of Defense, owing to the use of Cr(VI) compounds for aircraft fuselages (Salatas,
- Lowney, Pastorok, Nelson, & Ruby, 2004).

1.2 Chromium in soil-water systems

- When discussing the total concentration and speciation of Cr in foodstuffs, it is important to
- 57 consider the sources of Cr and the chemical forms present in these sources prior to plant uptake.
- 58 Whilst mitigating the issues associated with rapid urbanisation and water scarcity, it is well
- 59 documented that the irrigation of crops with untreated domestic and industrial effluents results in
- 60 accumulation of heavy metals in soils (Stasinos & Zabetakis, 2013) which increases the potential for
- 61 transfer into crops. Therefore, an understanding of the chemical behaviour of Cr in soil-water
- 62 systems is essential for predicting species stability and the likelihood of transfer into foodstuffs.
- 63 Chromium in water originates from natural sources such as the weathering of rocks and
- 64 precipitation, with elevated concentrations attributed to wastewater from industrial sources
- 65 (Stasicka, 2000). Chromium has a strong affinity with ultrabasic and basic rocks (peridotite,
- 66 serpentinite, gabbro, dolerite and basalt), because some pyroxenes (e.g. kosmochlor) have
- 67 undergone isomorphic substitution of Cr(III) for Al (Oze, Fendorf, Bird, & Coleman, 2004). Chromium
- 68 in soils typically originates from fallout and washout of Cr-containing particles (Stasicka, 2000)
- 69 through geochemical processes such as weathering, diagenetic reactions and volcanic eruptions
- 70 (Prado, Hilal, Chocobar-Ponce, Pagano, Rosa, & Prado, 2016). Agricultural use of sewage sludge as a
- 71 fertiliser can also introduce Cr into soils (Loubna, Hafidi, Silvestre, Kallerhoff, Merlina, & Pinelli,
- 72 2015). Background concentrations of Cr in European soils are typically between 5 and 68 mg kg⁻¹
- 73 (Utermann, Düwel, & Nagel, 2006). Disposal of industrial waste can lead to percent levels of Cr in
- soil, with the highest concentrations reported in India, East Africa, South America and China (Shahid,
- 75 Shamshad, Rafiq, Khalid, Bibi, Niazi, et al., 2017).
- Due to its presence as cationic species such as Cr³⁺, Cr(OH)²⁺ and Cr(OH)₂+, Cr(III) tends to form
- 577 strong complexes with alumino-silicate clays, soil organic matter and Fe/Al hydrous oxides in soil,

which restricts the mobility and bioavailability of Cr(III). The affinity of soil for Cr(III) increases with pH due to the increased negative charge on soil particles (Ritchie & Sposito, 2007). By contrast, the negative charge of Cr(VI) repels the predominantly-negatively charged clay minerals and humus in soil, accounting for the increased mobility and bioavailability of Cr(VI) as pH rises (Jardine, Stewart, Barnett, Basta, Brooks, Fendorf, et al., 2013). In the form of CrO_4^{2-} or $HCrO_4^{-}$, Cr(VI) is adsorbed by Fe/Al hydrous oxides (James & Bartlett, 1983). The oxidation of Cr(III) and reduction of Cr(VI) in soils is dependent on pH, oxygen concentration and the presence of appropriate redox coupling agents. Hexavalent Cr as CrO_4^{2-} and $HCrO_4^{-}$ can be reduced by Fe(II) and sulphide (James & Bartlett, 1983), with Fe(II) dominating at pH > 5.5 and sulphide dominating at lower pH (Fendorf, Wielinga, & Hansel, 2000). Oxidation of Cr(III) to Cr(VI) can occur in the presence of oxidised manganese as Mn(IV)O₂ (Bartlett & James, 1979).

The toxicity of Cr to plants has been extensively covered in a number of reviews (Shanker, Cervantes, Loza-Tavera, & Avudainayagam, 2005). Chromium has no essential role in plant metabolism (Mertz, 1969) and is poorly translocated within plants (Singh, Mahajan, Kaur, Batish, & Kohli, 2013). This is likely due to Cr(III) binding to cell walls (A. Zayed, Lytle, Qian, & Terry, 1998), leading to increased concentrations of Cr in the roots (Kabata-Pendias, 2010). Both Cr(III) and Cr(VI) can be absorbed, although preferential uptake of Cr(VI) through sulphate carriers has been observed (Banerjee, Nayak, Chakrabortty, & Lahiri, 2008). Ultimately Cr(VI) is reduced to Cr(III) in roots by Fe(III) reductase enzymes (A. Zayed, Lytle, Qian, & Terry, 1998). Deleterious effects, including restricted root growth, biomass reduction and distortion of leaf appearance have been recorded for plants grown in media with excess Cr(III) and Cr(VI) (Dube, Tewari, Chatterjee, & Chatterjee, 2003).

The toxicity and greater mobility of Cr(VI) has led to a number of research articles concerned with quantitatively evaluating the Cr(VI) content in a variety of foodstuffs, including milk (Lameiras, Elisa Soares, Lourdes Bastos, & Ferreira, 1998), mushrooms (Figueiredo, Soares, Baptista, Castro, & Bastos, 2007), tea (Chen, Zhu, He, & Lu, 2014), bread (Soares, Vieira, & Bastos, 2010) and beer (Vieira, Soares, Kozior, Krejpcio, Ferreira, & Bastos, 2014), utilising different sample preparation techniques and analytical methodologies. Meat, dairy products, bread and tea are the most studied as they constitute the main sources of Cr in the human diet (Lendinez, Lorenzo, Cabrera, & López, 2001). The key objective is to assess the oral genotoxicity of Cr(VI) from foodstuffs to reduce the risk to human health from this pathway (Proctor, Otani, Finley, Paustenbach, Bland, Speizer, et al., 2002). It is likely that any ingested Cr(VI) will be reduced to Cr(III) in the acidic conditions of the stomach (Milacic & Stupar, 1994), and any Cr(VI) transferred from soil to plant will also be reduced. However, there are other sources of Cr(VI) introduced during the manufacture and processing of foodstuffs (e.g. stainless steel vats) that justify the need to undertake Cr speciation. It is therefore vital to understand the limitations and interferences of each speciation technique. To the author's knowledge, this article represents the first literature report to compile and critically review the speciation of Cr in foodstuffs over the last twenty years.

2.0 Analytical methods for chromium speciation in foodstuffs

The approach to Cr speciation in foodstuffs can be broken down into two categories: off-line determination of Cr species following sample pre-treatment and on-line speciation of the pre-treated sample using hyphenated techniques. The pre-treatment step is designed to solubilise all forms of Cr(VI) in the sample without inducing oxidation of Cr(III) or reduction of Cr(VI) (Unceta,

Séby, Malherbe, & Donard, 2010). This is particularly important because, depending on the sample matrix, the concentration of Cr(III) can be between 10 and 1000 times greater than the concentration of Cr(VI) (Ndung'u, Djane, Malcus, & Mathiasson, 1999). The use of solid-state speciation techniques for foodstuffs has not been reported in the literature and is therefore outside the scope of this review. Table 1 is a summary of the reported literature for the speciation of Cr in foodstuffs, with analytical merits indicated; the table is arranged according to foodstuff. A number of additional articles have summarised the speciation of Cr in other solid matrices (Unceta, Séby, Malherbe, & Donard, 2010). Table 2 is a summary of the reported Cr(VI) concentrations for the literature in Table 1.

2.1 Sample Pretreatment

128

- 129 The extraction of Cr(VI) is most commonly undertaken in an alkaline medium due to the stability of 130 Cr(VI) in high-pH matrices (Zhao, Sobecky, Zhao, Crawford, & Li, 2016). The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) developed a number of extraction methods that are in common use; for 131 example (1) Method 3060A Alkaline Digestion for Hexavalent Chromium (United States 132 Environmental Protection Agency, 1996) and (2) Method 7196A Hexavalent Chromium by 133 134 Colorimetry (United States Environmental Protection Agency, 1992). The latter is based on the 135 reaction of Cr(VI) with diphenylcarbazide (DPC) to form a Cr-diphenylcarbazone complex which can 136 be detected using UV-Vis Spectrophotometry at 540 nm. The main disadvantages of this technique 137 are comparatively high detection limits (typically 0.5 mg L⁻¹) and susceptibility to interfering species 138 including molybdenum, vanadium, mercury and iron. The release of humic compounds during the 139 extraction can also bias determination of Cr(VI), as these also absorb at 540 nm (Pettine & Capri, 140 2005).
- 141 To account for this, and the possibility of Cr(III) oxidation under alkaline conditions, Method 3060A 142 was developed; this involves extracting the sample using 0.28M Na₂CO₃/0.5M NaOH at 90-95°C for 60 minutes. In cases of high Cr(III) concentrations the addition of Mg²⁺ can suppress oxidation of 143 Cr(III) to Cr(VI). The resulting solution can then be analysed using a suitable off-line or on-line 144 145 analytical technique (United States Environmental Protection Agency, 1996). The majority of Cr(III) in 146 the sample precipitates out in the form of hydroxides, oxides and carbonates (Rahman, Kingston, 147 Towns, Vitale, & Clay, 2005) which can be filtered out of the solution prior to analysis. The species 148 present in the insoluble solid can then be determined and a Cr mass balance employed to confirm 149 the efficiency of the entire procedure (Wolle, Rahman, Skip Kingston, & Pamuku, 2014).
- 150 Ammonium nitrate (NH₄NO₃) (Soares, Vieira, & Bastos, 2010) and ammonium hydroxide (NH₄OH) 151 (Vacchina, de la Calle, & Séby, 2015) have also been used for selective extraction of Cr(VI). Aside 152 from alkaline extraction, solid phase extraction (SPE) columns can be used to selectively retain Cr(III) 153 or Cr(VI); this method also enables pre-concentration of the retained species for improved detection 154 limits (Ahmad, Murthy, & Chandra, 1990), (Narin, Kars, & Soylak, 2008). Solid phase extraction can 155 utilize alumina columns (Mahmoud, Yakout, Ahmed, & Osman, 2008) or nanotubes (Chen, Zhu, He, 156 & Lu, 2014), occasionally with a reduction step to convert Cr(VI) to Cr(III) for retention on the SPE 157 medium.
- 158 Cloud point extraction (CPE) has recently been used by Tiwari et al. for speciation of Cr in turmeric to 159 investigate food adulteration (Tiwari, Deb, & Sen, 2017). Cloud point extraction has been used for 160 speciation of Cr in waters (Kiran, Kumar, Prasad, Suvardhan, Lekkala, & Janardhanam, 2008), (Zhu, 161 Hu, Jiang, & Li, 2005) and is considered to be a "greener" method of pre-concentration and 162 speciation owing to the use of fewer harmful chemicals (Samaddar & Sen, 2014). Tiwari et al. used 163 diffuse reflectance-Fourier transform infrared spectroscopy (DRS-FTIR) to analyse Cr(VI) complexed 164 with 1,5-diphenylcarbazide, offering a lower cost alternative to other techniques at the expense of 165 higher detection limits.

2.2 Off-Line Analytical Techniques

Off-line analytical techniques can be described as instrumentation with no separation technique at the point of analysis, requiring the separation of chemical species through selective extraction prior to determination of Cr concentration. Off-line techniques require minimal sample preparation and post-analysis processing. Up until c. 2013, the speciation of Cr in foodstuffs was undertaken using off-line techniques, with the most common detection method being electrothermal atomic absorption spectrometry (ETAAS) (Figueiredo, Soares, Baptista, Castro, & Bastos, 2007; Lameiras, Elisa Soares, Lourdes Bastos, & Ferreira, 1998; Panichev, Mandiwana, Kataeva, & Siebert, 2005; Soares, Vieira, & Bastos, 2010), followed by inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry (ICP-MS) (Ambushe, McCrindle, & McCrindle, 2009) and flame atomic absorption spectroscopy (FAAS) (Uluozlu, Tuzen, & Soylak, 2009). ETAAS is a mono-elemental technique capable of detection limits lower than 1 µg L⁻¹ using sample volumes less than 100 µl (Daftsis & Zachariadis, 2007), making it suitable for the sensitive determination of Cr. The larger linear dynamic range of FAAS is applicable to samples with high concentrations of Cr(VI) (Marqués, Salvador, Morales-Rubio, & Guardia, 2000).

Aside from spectrometric techniques, electroanalytical speciation of Cr in foodstuffs was reported by Abbasi *et al.* (Abbasi & Bahiraei, 2012) using catalytic adsorptive stripping voltammetry. The speciation of Cr(VI) in vinegar was achieved with a detection limit of 0.002 µg L⁻¹. Electroanalytical speciation has also been used for speciation of Cr in soil samples (Grabarczyk, Korolczuk, & Tyszczuk, 2006). The main issue with this form of speciation is the underlying assumption that all of the Cr measured in the extract is in the form of Cr(VI), and that no species interconversions have taken place during and/or after the extraction procedure.

Prior to the development and implementation of speciated isotope dilution mass spectrometry (SIDMS), a number of research articles reported Cr(VI) concentrations in bread (Soares, Vieira, & Bastos, 2010) and tea (Mandiwana, Panichev, & Panicheva, 2011) and estimated daily intakes of Cr(VI) based on these results (Novotnik, Zuliani, Scancar, & Milacic, 2013). The organic content of bread and presence of antioxidants in tea is likely to induce reduction of Cr(VI) to Cr(III) (Vacchina, de la Calle, & Séby, 2015), which would be highlighted by on-line separation techniques.

193 <u>2.3 On-Line Analytical Techniques</u>

The uncertainty surrounding off-line analytical techniques has led to a number of on-line methods incorporating pre-instrument separation and subsequent determination of Cr species. The ease of coupling chromatographic methods, such as high performance liquid chromatography (HPLC), to ICP-MS has led to an increase in the number of published studies using this approach to undertake Cr speciation in foodstuffs. These methods also allow for isotopic labelling of Cr(III) and Cr(VI) for SIDMS applications, where species interconversions can be monitored throughout the digestion and analysis procedures. EPA Method 6800 (Samaddar & Sen, 2014) utilises the same alkaline extraction as Method 3060A, but during the preparation step known quantities of isotopically-labelled Cr(III) and Cr(VI) are added and equilibrated with the sample. By monitoring the isotope of each species, redox conversions can be corrected for through the application of deconvolution calculations (Meija, Yang, Caruso, & Mester, 2006).

The enriched Cr isotopes ⁵⁰Cr(III) and ⁵³Cr(VI) are most commonly used as isotopic spikes due to their ease of preparation, with a few laboratories offering bespoke products designed for SIDMS applications (Applied Isotope Technologies). Single-spike isotope dilution mass spectrometry (IDMS)

- has also been explored, where samples are spiked with only one isotope corresponding to the species of interest. Guidotti *et al.* demonstrated reliable extraction and quantification of Cr(VI) in contaminated soils using ⁵³Cr(VI) and ethylenediaminetetraacetic acid (EDTA) extraction, with minimal reduction of Cr(VI) even in soils with high Fe and organic matter content (Guidotti, Abad, Rodríguez-González, Alonso, & Beone, 2015).
- Anion-exchange columns are most frequently used to separate Cr species (Sabty-Daily, Luk, & Froines, 2002). If the sample pre-treatment step does not include a chelating agent, such as EDTA, Cr(VI) will be the only species attracted to the stationary phase of the column. The presence of polyatomic interferences associated with the extraction matrix, such as ⁴⁰Ar¹²C⁺ and ³⁵Cl¹⁶O¹H⁺, can be controlled using the collision or reaction cell of the ICP-MS; this is usually achieved by
- 218 pressurising with NH₃ (Chang & Jiang, 2001) or He (Hagendorfer & Goessler, 2008).

2.4 Reference Materials- Validation of Speciation Methodology

One of the main limitations associated with elemental speciation is the verification of the accuracy of the speciation methodology and sample preparation procedures. Non-aqueous matrix-specific certified reference materials (CRMs) are difficult to produce due to potential species instability and interconversions during the extraction procedure (Oliveira, 2012). Commonly the accuracy of these methodologies is determined through spike recoveries, but these fail to take into account the possibility for species interactions with matrix components (James, Petura, Vitale, & Mussoline, 1995). Although currently no CRM exists for speciation of Cr in foodstuffs, the National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST) have produced the only CRM for Cr speciation in contaminated soils, Standard Reference Material® SRM 2701 (Nagourney, Wilson, Buckley, Kingston, Yang, & Long, 2008). Data from EPA Method 6800 were used to produce a certified value for Cr(VI) in this material, with the conclusion that this CRM should be included as an external quality control sample to confirm the accuracy of Cr(VI) analyses in Cr-containing waste. The development of CRMs for Cr(VI) in a range of foodstuffs, particularly bread, dairy products and tea that may be adulterated by manufacturing and processing methods, is an important consideration for the validation of future work.

2.5 Disparity of results between off-line and on-line analytical techniques

As mentioned previously, the results obtained from off-line and on-line analytical techniques have led to conflicting conclusions regarding the content of Cr(VI) in foodstuffs. One particular example is the presence of Cr(VI) in bread. Prior to the implementation of SIDMS, Soares *et al.* investigated bread samples using alkaline extraction and ETAAS, reporting Cr(VI) as representing 12% of the total Cr concentration (5.65 \pm 5.44 μ g kg⁻¹ for white bread and 6.82 \pm 4.88 μ g kg⁻¹ for wholegrain bread) (Soares, Vieira, & Bastos, 2010). Novotnik *et al.* repeated the experiment using SIDMS, showing that Cr(VI) is not stable in bread extracts and is partially reduced to Cr(III) by organic matter within the sample, with the extent of reduction greater in wholegrain bread compared to white (Novotnik, Zuliani, Scancar, & Milacic, 2013). Cr(VI) values could not be reported for alkaline extracts of bread in this work. This highlights the issue of reporting species concentrations without a speciation step; selective extraction alone cannot account for poor extraction efficiency or interconversions, and any assessments of dietary intake could be significantly skewed as a result. More recently, Mathebula *et al.* reported that between 33 and 73% (58.17 \pm 5.12 μ g kg⁻¹ to 156.1 \pm 6.66 μ g kg⁻¹) of total Cr in

bread samples from South Africa was Cr(VI) using selective extraction and high resolution continuum source atomic absorption spectrometry, although it was concluded that average consumption would not exceed maximum acceptable concentrations of Cr(VI) of 0.003 mg kg⁻¹ bw⁻¹ day⁻¹ according to the US EPA (Mathebula, Mandiwana, & Panichev, 2017). Therefore, the lack of an on-line speciation procedure and the proven issues with Cr(VI) reduction in bread extracts casts doubt on results and conclusions for Cr(VI) concentrations in bread determined using off-line analytical techniques.

Another example is the Cr(VI) content of tea, namely tea leaves and tea infusions. Mandiwana et al. used alkaline extraction and ETAAS to carry out Cr speciation in black, green and herbal teas (Mandiwana, Panichev, & Panicheva, 2011). Cr(VI) concentrations were reported between 0.03 and 3.15 $\mu g g^{-1}$ for black tea and 0.03 and 0.14 $\mu g g^{-1}$ for green tea; Cr(VI) in herbal tea was below the detection limit. Based on the preparation of 200 ml of black tea using 2.0 g tea material, it was determined that 17.5 µg L⁻¹ of Cr(VI) could be consumed per unit cup. Novotnik et al. repeated this experiment using on-line speciation techniques with isotopic tracers (53Cr(III) and 50Cr(VI)), proving that Cr(VI) is reduced to Cr(III) by antioxidants in tea below the detection limit of 0.06 μg L⁻¹. In highly alkaline extracts Cr(III) can be partially extracted as Cr(OH)₄, and if no on-line speciation procedure is used then this will be interpreted as Cr(VI) during the measurement step. Chen et al. used titanium dioxide nanotubes (TDNTs) to carry out solid phase extraction on tea infusions, reporting Cr(VI) concentrations of 0.12 \pm 0.011 μg g⁻¹. Cr(VI) was determined as the difference between total Cr and Cr(III) retained on the TDNTs. However, Cr(III) in tea infusions can form neutral and negativelycharged complexes with organic ligands which will not be retained on the TDNTs, leading to erroneous results as no on-line speciation technique or isotopic tracing was performed to identify the formation of these complexes (Novotnik, Zuliani, Ščančar, & Milačič, 2015). These issues of analytical artefacts can only be prevented through the use of on-line analytical techniques; widespread adoption of these speciation methods will therefore lead to more reliable assessment of the Cr(VI) content in foodstuffs.

2.6 Measurement of Cr(III)

The majority of the analytical methods reviewed in this article prioritise measurement of Cr(VI) over Cr(III) due to the known genotoxicity of Cr(VI). However, the use of Cr(III) compounds in nutritional supplements has generated a number of research articles assessing the biological importance and potential toxicity of Cr(III) (Lukaski, 2007). The use of Cr(III)-containing supplements has increased over the last 15 years (Prado, Hilal, Chocobar-Ponce, Pagano, Rosa, & Prado, 2016), with emphasis being placed on the putative ability of the supplements to control diabetes and aid in weight loss. There are a number of Cr(III) compounds used in nutritional supplements, with Cr picolinate being the most common due to its relatively high bioavailability (A. M. Zayed & Terry, 2003). Sales of Cr(III)-containing supplements are approximately \$100 million per year (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services), accounting for 6% of all supplement sales (Chen, Zhu, He, & Lu, 2014). Despite this large market it has been shown that, while Cr(III) may play a role in the management of type II diabetes (Bailey, 2014), there is no significant improvement or acceleration of weight loss that can be attributed solely to supplementation of Cr(III) (Dhal, Das, Thatoi, & Pandey, 2013). Recently, Wu et al. found that adipocytes treated with Cr(III) displayed localised regions or "hotspots" of Cr(V) and Cr(VI), likely formed during cell signalling where oxidising agents such as hydrogen peroxide are created with the potential to oxidise Cr(III) (Wu, Levina, Harris, Cai, Lai, Vogt, et al., 2016).

249

250

251

252

253

254

255

256257

258259

260261

262263

264

265

266267

268

269270

271

272

273

274

275

276

277

278

279

280

281

282

283

284285

286

287

288

289

Concerning the genotoxicity of Cr(III), a recent article by Fang *et al.* (Fang, Zhao, Zhen, Chen, Shi, & Huang, 2014) reported that both Cr(III) and Cr(VI) induce genetic mutations and DNA damage in yeast cells, with the effect of Cr(III) being greater than that of Cr(VI). The mechanism of DNA damage is also different; Cr(III) interferes with base pair stacking whilst Cr(VI) intercalates within DNA. As the research focus shifts to Cr(III) genotoxicity, and the potential for oxidation to Cr(VI) following ingestion, the need to measure Cr(III) as well as Cr(VI) is likely to become more commonplace. The likelihood of Cr(VI) reducing to Cr(III) during transfer into staple crops could increase the concentration of Cr(III) within the foodstuff (Lytle, Lytle, Yang, Qian, Hansen, Zayed, et al., 1998), potentially leading to an increased risk of exposure to Cr(VI) following Cr(III) re-oxidation in cells. Therefore, more research is needed to explore this possible route for Cr(VI) exposure, with future speciation methods incorporating measurement of both Cr(III) and Cr(VI).

3.0 Conclusion

291

292

293

294

295

296

297

298

299

300

301

302

303

304

305 306

307

308

309

310311

312

313

314

315

316

317

318

319

321

323

324

328

329

This article presented a review of the analytical techniques used to undertake Cr speciation in foodstuffs over the last twenty years. Selective extraction using an alkaline medium, commonly a mixture of NaOH/Na₂CO₃ or NaOH/NH₄NO₃, is the most widely used technique for liberating Cr(VI) from the foodstuff prior to determination using off-line (FAAS, ETAAS, ICP-MS) or on-line (HPLC-ICP-MS) analytical methods. For all techniques the main goal is to maximise the amount of Cr(VI) extracted from the foodstuff whilst minimising species interconversions. The introduction of SIDMS has highlighted problems with studies that utilised selective extraction with no on-line speciation step; despite this, researchers are continuing to publish data for Cr(VI) in foodstuffs and estimating daily intakes of Cr(VI) using off-line techniques. Without applying adequate speciation analysis using on-line techniques, there is a risk of introducing analytical artefacts that could lead to incorrect conclusions regarding the Cr(VI) content of complex food matrices. The only way to mitigate this issue is through the use of SIDMS to reliably determine Cr(VI) in foodstuffs and account for species interconversions during the extraction procedure or the formation of complexes due to the presence of available ligands in the sample matrix. In light of recent toxicological studies, future research should incorporate measurement of Cr(III) to better evaluate the health risks from consuming foodstuffs high in Cr.

Acknowledgments

320 This work is published with the permission of the Executive Director of the British Geological Survey.

Conflict of Interest

322 The author declares no conflict of interest.

References

Abbasi, S., & Bahiraei, A. (2012). Ultra trace quantification of chromium(VI) in food and water samples by highly sensitive catalytic adsorptive stripping voltammetry with rubeanic acid. *Food Chemistry*, *133*(3), 1075-1080.

Ahmad, S., Murthy, R. C., & Chandra, S. V. (1990). Chromium speciation by column chromatography using a direct current plasma atomic emission spectrometer. *Analyst*, *115*(3), 287-289.

- Ambushe, A. A., McCrindle, R. I., & McCrindle, C. M. E. (2009). Speciation of chromium in cow's milk by solid-phase extraction/dynamic reaction cell inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry (DRC-ICP-MS). *Journal of Analytical Atomic Spectrometry*, 24(4), 502-507.
- 333 Applied Isotope Technologies. D-IDMS & D-SIDMS. In, vol. 2016).
- Bailey, C. H. (2014). Improved Meta-Analytic Methods Show No Effect of Chromium Supplements on Fasting Glucose. *Biological Trace Element Research*, *157*(1), 1-8.
- Banerjee, A., Nayak, D., Chakrabortty, D., & Lahiri, S. (2008). Uptake studies of environmentally hazardous 51Cr in Mung beans. *Environmental Pollution*, *151*(2), 423-427.
 - Bartlett, R., & James, B. (1979). Behavior of Chromium in Soils: III. Oxidation1. *Journal of Environmental Quality, 8*(1).
 - Basketter, D., Slodovnik, D., Merimes, S., Trattner, A., & Ingber, A. (2000). Investigation of the threshold for allergic reactivity to chromium. *Contact Dermatitis*, 44, 70-74.
 - Brown, E. M. (1997). A Conformational Study of Collagen as Affected by Tanning Procedures. *Journal of the American Leather Chemists Association*, *92*, 225-233.
 - Chang, Y.-L., & Jiang, S.-J. (2001). Determination of chromium species in water samples by liquid chromatography-inductively coupled plasma-dynamic reaction cell-mass spectrometry. *Journal of Analytical Atomic Spectrometry*, 16(8), 858-862.
 - Chen, S., Zhu, S., He, Y., & Lu, D. (2014). Speciation of chromium and its distribution in tea leaves and tea infusion using titanium dioxide nanotubes packed microcolumn coupled with inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry. *Food Chemistry*, *150*, 254-259.
 - Daftsis, E. J., & Zachariadis, G. A. (2007). Analytical performance of ETAAS method for Cd, Co, Cr and Pb determination in blood fractions samples. *Talanta*, *71*(2), 722-730.
 - Dhal, B., Das, N. N., Thatoi, H. N., & Pandey, B. D. (2013). Characterizing toxic Cr(VI) contamination in chromite mine overburden dump and its bacterial remediation. *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, 260, 141-149.
 - Dube, B. K., Tewari, K., Chatterjee, J., & Chatterjee, C. (2003). Excess chromium alters uptake and translocation of certain nutrients in citrullus. *Chemosphere*, *53*(9), 1147-1153.
 - Ellis, D. I., Brewster, V. L., Dunn, W. B., Allwood, J. W., Golovanov, A. P., & Goodacre, R. (2012). Fingerprinting food: current technologies for the detection of food adulteration and contamination. *Chemical Society Reviews*, *41*(17), 5706-5727.
 - Fang, Z., Zhao, M., Zhen, H., Chen, L., Shi, P., & Huang, Z. (2014). Genotoxicity of Tri- and Hexavalent Chromium Compounds *In Vivo* and Their Modes of Action on DNA Damage *In Vitro*. *PLoS ONE*, *9*(8), e103194.
 - Fendorf, S., Wielinga, B. W., & Hansel, C. M. (2000). Chromium Transformations in Natural Environments: The Role of Biological and Abiological Processes in Chromium(VI) Reduction. *International Geology Review, 42*(8), 691-701.
 - Figueiredo, E., Soares, M. E., Baptista, P., Castro, M., & Bastos, M. L. (2007). Validation of an Electrothermal Atomization Atomic Absorption Spectrometry Method for Quantification of Total Chromium and Chromium(VI) in Wild Mushrooms and Underlying Soils. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 55(17), 7192-7198.
 - Gettens, J. R. (1966). Painting Materials: A Short Encyclopaedia: Courier Dover Pulications.
 - Grabarczyk, M., Korolczuk, M., & Tyszczuk, K. (2006). Extraction and determination of hexavalent chromium in soil samples. *Analytical and Bioanalytical Chemistry*, 386(2), 357-362.
- Guidotti, L., Abad, S. Q., Rodríguez-González, P., Alonso, J. I. G., & Beone, G. M. (2015).

 Quantification of Cr(VI) in soil samples from a contaminated area in northern Italy by isotope dilution mass spectrometry. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 22(22), 17569-17576.
- Hagendorfer, H., & Goessler, W. (2008). Separation of chromium(III) and chromium(VI) by ion chromatography and an inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometer as element-selective detector. *Talanta*, *76*(3), 656-661.

- Health and Safety Executive. (2013). Chromium and you. Working with chromium are you at risk?

 In).
- Hingston, J. A., Collins, C. D., Murphy, R. J., & Lester, J. N. (2001). Leaching of chromated copper arsenate wood preservatives: a review. *Environmental Pollution*, *111*(1), 53-66.
- James, B. R., & Bartlett, R. J. (1983). Behavior of Chromium in Soils: VII. Adsorption and Reduction of Hexavalent Forms1. *Journal of Environmental Quality, 12*(2).
 - James, B. R., Petura, J. C., Vitale, R. J., & Mussoline, G. R. (1995). Hexavalent Chromium Extraction from Soils: A Comparison of Five Methods. *Environmental Science & Technology, 29*(9), 2377-2381.
 - Jardine, P. M., Stewart, M. A., Barnett, M. O., Basta, N. T., Brooks, S. C., Fendorf, S., & Mehlhorn, T. L. (2013). Influence of Soil Geochemical and Physical Properties on Chromium(VI) Sorption and Bioaccessibility. *Environmental Science & Technology*, 47(19), 11241-11248.
- 392 Kabata-Pendias, A. (2010). Trace Elements in Soils and Plants, Fourth Edition: CRC Press.
 - Kendig, M., Jeanjaquet, S., Addison, R., & Waldrop, J. (2001). Role of hexavalent chromium in the inhibition of corrosion of aluminum alloys. *Surface and Coatings Technology, 140*(1), 58-66.
 - Kiran, K., Kumar, K. S., Prasad, B., Suvardhan, K., Lekkala, R. B., & Janardhanam, K. (2008). Speciation determination of chromium(III) and (VI) using preconcentration cloud point extraction with flame atomic absorption spectrometry (FAAS). *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, 150(3), 582-586.
 - Lameiras, J., Elisa Soares, M., Lourdes Bastos, M., & Ferreira, M. (1998). Quantification of total chromium and hexavalent chromium in UHT milk by ETAAS. *Analyst*, *123*(10), 2091-2095.
 - Lendinez, E., Lorenzo, M. L., Cabrera, C., & López, M. C. (2001). Chromium in basic foods of the Spanish diet: seafood, cereals, vegetables, olive oils and dairy products. *Science of The Total Environment*, *278*(1–3), 183-189.
 - Loubna, E. F., Hafidi, M., Silvestre, J., Kallerhoff, J., Merlina, G., & Pinelli, E. (2015). Efficiency of cocomposting process to remove genotoxicity from sewage sludge contaminated with hexavalent chromium. *Ecological Engineering*, 82, 355-360.
 - Lukaski, H. C. (2007). Chapter 4 Effects of chromium(III) as a nutritional supplement*,† A2 Vincent, John B. In *The Nutritional Biochemistry of Chromium (III)*, (pp. 71-84). Amsterdam: Elsevier.
 - Lytle, C. M., Lytle, F. W., Yang, N., Qian, J.-H., Hansen, D., Zayed, A., & Terry, N. (1998). Reduction of Cr(VI) to Cr(III) by Wetland Plants: Potential for In Situ Heavy Metal Detoxification. *Environmental Science & Technology*, *32*(20), 3087-3093.
 - Mahmoud, M. E., Yakout, A. A., Ahmed, S. B., & Osman, M. M. (2008). Speciation, selective extraction and preconcentration of chromium ions via alumina-functionalized-isatin-thiosemicarbazone. *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, 158(2–3), 541-548.
 - Mandiwana, K. L., Panichev, N., & Panicheva, S. (2011). Determination of chromium(VI) in black, green and herbal teas. *Food Chemistry*, *129*(4), 1839-1843.
- Marqués, M. J., Salvador, A., Morales-Rubio, A., & Guardia, M. d. l. (2000). Chromium speciation in liquid matrices: a survey of the literature. *Fresenius' Journal of Analytical Chemistry, 367*(7), 601-613.
- Mathebula, M. W., Mandiwana, K., & Panichev, N. (2017). Speciation of chromium in bread and breakfast cereals. *Food Chemistry*, *217*, 655-659.
- McCarroll, N., Keshava, N., Chen, J., Akerman, G., Kligerman, A., & Rinde, E. (2010). An evaluation of the mode of action framework for mutagenic carcinogens case study II: Chromium (VI). *Environmental and Molecular Mutagenesis*, *51*(2), 89-111.
- Meija, J., Yang, L., Caruso, J. A., & Mester, Z. (2006). Calculations of double spike isotope dilution results revisited. *Journal of Analytical Atomic Spectrometry, 21*(11), 1294-1297.
- Mercer, T. G., & Frostick, L. E. (2012). Leaching characteristics of CCA-treated wood waste: A UK study. *Science of The Total Environment*, *427–428*, 165-174.
- 429 Mertz, W. (1969). Chromium occurrence and function in biological systems. *Physiological Reviews,* 430 49(2), 163-239.

387

388

389

390

391

393

394

395

396

397

398 399

400

401

402

403

404

405

406

407

408

409

410

411

412

413

414

415

- 431 Milacic, R., & Stupar, J. (1994). Simultaneous determination of chromium(III) complexes and chromium(VI) by fast protein anion-exchange liquid chromatography-atomic absorption spectrometry. *Analyst*, *119*(4), 627-632.
- Nagourney, S. J., Wilson, S. A., Buckley, B., Kingston, H. M. S., Yang, S.-Y., & Long, S. E. (2008).

 Development of a standard reference material for Cr(vi) in contaminated soil. *Journal of Analytical Atomic Spectrometry*, 23(11), 1550-1554.
- Narin, I., Kars, A., & Soylak, M. (2008). A novel solid phase extraction procedure on Amberlite XAD-1180 for speciation of Cr(III), Cr(VI) and total chromium in environmental and pharmaceutical samples. *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, 150(2), 453-458.
 - Ndung'u, K., Djane, N.-K., Malcus, F., & Mathiasson, L. (1999). Ultrasonic extraction of hexavalent chromium in solid samples followed by automated analysis using a combination of supported liquid membrane extraction and UV detection in a flow system. *Analyst*, 124(9), 1367-1372.
 - Novotnik, B., Zuliani, T., Scancar, J., & Milacic, R. (2013). Chromate in food samples: an artefact of wrongly applied analytical methodology? *Journal of Analytical Atomic Spectrometry*, 28(4), 558-566.
 - Novotnik, B., Zuliani, T., Ščančar, J., & Milačič, R. (2015). Content of trace elements and chromium speciation in Neem powder and tea infusions. *Journal of Trace Elements in Medicine and Biology*, *31*, 98-106.
 - Office of Dietary Supplements: National Institute of Health. (2013). Dietary Supplement Fact Sheet: Chromium. In).
- Oliveira, H. (2012). Chromium as an Environmental Pollutant: Insights on Induced Plant Toxicity. *Journal of Botany, 2012*, 8.
 - Oze, C., Fendorf, S., Bird, D. K., & Coleman, R. G. (2004). Chromium geochemistry in serpentinized ultramafic rocks and serpentine soils from the Franciscan Complex of California. *American Journal of Science*, 304(1), 67-101.
 - Panichev, N., Mandiwana, K., Kataeva, M., & Siebert, S. (2005). Determination of Cr(VI) in plants by electrothermal atomic absorption spectrometry after leaching with sodium carbonate. *Spectrochimica Acta Part B: Atomic Spectroscopy, 60*(5), 699-703.
 - Pettine, M., & Capri, S. (2005). Digestion treatments and risks of Cr(III)–Cr(VI) interconversions during Cr(VI) determination in soils and sediments—a review. *Analytica Chimica Acta,* 540(2), 231-238.
 - Prado, F. E., Hilal, M., Chocobar-Ponce, S., Pagano, E., Rosa, M., & Prado, C. (2016). Chapter 6 Chromium and the Plant: A Dangerous Affair? A2 Ahmad, Parvaiz. In *Plant Metal Interaction*, (pp. 149-177): Elsevier.
 - Proctor, D. M., Otani, J. M., Finley, B. L., Paustenbach, D. J., Bland, J. A., Speizer, N., & Sargent, E. V. (2002). IS HEXAVALENT CHROMIUM CARCINOGENIC VIA INGESTION? A WEIGHT-OF-EVIDENCE REVIEW. *Journal of Toxicology and Environmental Health, Part A, 65*(10), 701-746.
 - Rahman, G. M. M., Kingston, H. M. S., Towns, T. G., Vitale, R. J., & Clay, K. R. (2005). Determination of hexavalent chromium by using speciated isotope-dilution mass spectrometry after microwave speciated extraction of environmental and other solid materials. *Analytical and Bioanalytical Chemistry*, 382(4), 1111-1120.
- Ritchie, G. S. P., & Sposito, G. (2007). Speciation in Soils. In *Chemical Speciation in the Environment*, (pp. 237-264): Blackwell Science Ltd.
 - Sabty-Daily, R. A., Luk, K. K., & Froines, J. R. (2002). The efficiency of alkaline extraction for the recovery of hexavalent chromium (CrVI) from paint samples and the effect of sample storage on CrVI recovery. *Analyst*, 127(6), 852-858.
- Salatas, J. H., Lowney, Y. W., Pastorok, R. A., Nelson, R. R., & Ruby, M. V. (2004). Metals that Drive Health-Based Remedial Decisions for Soils at U.S. Department of Defense Sites. *Human and Ecological Risk Assessment, 18*(983-997).

- Samaddar, P., & Sen, K. (2014). Cloud point extraction: A sustainable method of elemental preconcentration and speciation. *Journal of Industrial and Engineering Chemistry, 20*(4), 1209-1219.
- Shahid, M., Shamshad, S., Rafiq, M., Khalid, S., Bibi, I., Niazi, N. K., Dumat, C., & Rashid, M. I. (2017).

 Chromium speciation, bioavailability, uptake, toxicity and detoxification in soil-plant system:

 A review. *Chemosphere*, *178*, 513-533.
- Shanker, A. K., Cervantes, C., Loza-Tavera, H., & Avudainayagam, S. (2005). Chromium toxicity in plants. *Environment International*, *31*(5), 739-753.
- Singh, H. P., Mahajan, P., Kaur, S., Batish, D. R., & Kohli, R. K. (2013). Chromium toxicity and tolerance in plants. *Environmental Chemistry Letters*, *11*(3), 229-254.
 - Soares, M. E., Vieira, E., & Bastos, M. d. L. (2010). Chromium Speciation Analysis in Bread Samples. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 58(2), 1366-1370.
 - Stasicka, J. (2000). Chromium occurrence in the environment and methods of its speciation. *Environmental Pollution*, *92*, 263-283.
 - Stasinos, S., & Zabetakis, I. (2013). The uptake of nickel and chromium from irrigation water by potatoes, carrots and onions. *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety*, *91*, 122-128.
 - Tiwari, S., Deb, M. K., & Sen, B. K. (2017). Cloud point extraction and diffuse reflectance-Fourier transform infrared spectroscopic determination of chromium(VI): A probe to adulteration in food stuffs. *Food Chemistry*, 221, 47-53.
 - U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. Executive Summary Chromium Picolinate. In).
 - Uluozlu, O. D., Tuzen, M., & Soylak, M. (2009). Speciation and separation of Cr(VI) and Cr(III) using coprecipitation with Ni2+/2-Nitroso-1-naphthol-4-sulfonic acid and determination by FAAS in water and food samples. *Food and Chemical Toxicology, 47*(10), 2601-2605.
 - Unceta, N., Séby, F., Malherbe, J., & Donard, O. F. X. (2010). Chromium speciation in solid matrices and regulation: a review. *Analytical and Bioanalytical Chemistry*, *397*(3), 1097-1111.
 - United States Environmental Protection Agency. (1992). Chromium, Hexavalent (Colorimetric). In). Washington, D.C.
 - United States Environmental Protection Agency. (1996). Alkaline Digestion for Hexavalent Chromium. In). Washington, D.C.
 - Utermann, J., Düwel, O., & Nagel, I. (2006). Background values in European soils and sewage sludges. Results of a JRC-coordinated study on background values (Part II). In). European Commission DG-JRC., EUR 22265 EN. Luxembourg:Office for Official Publications of the European Communities.
 - Vacchina, V., de la Calle, I., & Séby, F. (2015). Cr(VI) speciation in foods by HPLC-ICP-MS: investigation of Cr(VI)/food interactions by size exclusion and Cr(VI) determination and stability by ion-exchange on-line separations. *Analytical and Bioanalytical Chemistry*, 407(13), 3831-3839.
- Vieira, E., Soares, M. E., Kozior, M., Krejpcio, Z., Ferreira, I. M. P. L. V. O., & Bastos, M. L. (2014).

 Quantification of Total and Hexavalent Chromium in Lager Beers: Variability between Styles and Estimation of Daily Intake of Chromium from Beer. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 62(37), 9195-9200.
- Wolle, M. M., Rahman, G. M. M., Skip Kingston, H. M., & Pamuku, M. (2014). Optimization and validation of strategies for quantifying chromium species in soil based on speciated isotope dilution mass spectrometry with mass balance. *Journal of Analytical Atomic Spectrometry*, 29(9), 1640-1647.
- Wu, L. E., Levina, A., Harris, H. H., Cai, Z., Lai, B., Vogt, S., James, D. E., & Lay, P. A. (2016).
 Carcinogenic Chromium(VI) Compounds Formed by Intracellular Oxidation of Chromium(III)
 Dietary Supplements by Adipocytes. *Angewandte Chemie International Edition*, 55(5), 1742 1745.
- Zayed, A., Lytle, M. C., Qian, J.-H., & Terry, N. (1998). Chromium accumulation, translocation and chemical speciation in vegetable crops. *Planta*, *206*(2), 293-299.

492

493

494

495

496

497

498

499

500

501

502

503

504

505

506

507

508

509

510

511

512

513

514

515

- Zayed, A. M., & Terry, N. (2003). Chromium in the environment: factors affecting biological remediation. *Plant and Soil, 249*(1), 139-156.
- Zhao, X., Sobecky, P. A., Zhao, L., Crawford, P., & Li, M. (2016). Chromium(VI) transport and fate in unsaturated zone and aquifer: 3D Sandbox results. *Journal of Hazardous Materials, 306*, 203-209.
- Zhu, X., Hu, B., Jiang, Z., & Li, M. (2005). Cloud point extraction for speciation of chromium in water samples by electrothermal atomic absorption spectrometry. *Water Research, 39*(4), 589-595.