

Currents in Pharmacy Teaching and Learning

A CALL TO AN URGENT ACTION TO CHANGE IN THE CURRICULUM ON COMMUNICATION SKILLS FOR PHARMACY UNDERGRADUATES IN TURKEY: A COMPARISON WITH THE UK

--Manuscript Draft--

Manuscript Number:	CPTL-D-20-00198R2
Article Type:	Commentary
Keywords:	communication skills training; integrated curriculum; pharmacy education; community pharmacy
Corresponding Author:	Gizem Gülpınar Ankara Üniversitesi Eczacılık Fakültesi TURKEY
First Author:	Gizem Gülpınar, Dr.
Order of Authors:	Gizem Gülpınar, Dr. Claire Mann, Dr. Claire Anderson, Prof.
Manuscript Region of Origin:	Europe
Abstract:	<p>Introduction: Globally, pharmacy undergraduate programs are evolving to reflect a more patient-centered approach to clinical practice. The importance of teaching communication skills in any undergraduate pharmacy curriculum cannot be overstated. This paper aims to shed a light on the way forward by comparing current literature and practices related to pharmacy services and CST in pharmacy undergraduate education in the UK and Turkey and discusses the need for an urgent change in the curriculum on CST in Turkey. Additionally, it provides potential strategies for improving the quality of CST and for expanding pharmacy practice to ensure students and graduates are motivated to use communication skills.</p> <p>Commentary: The concept of traditionally structured curriculum with the basic sciences components in the early years and clinical experiences in the later years should be changed into an integrated environment where CST could be offered more effectively. CST offered at the University of Nottingham could be considered as a framework.</p> <p>Implications: To meet patient care and educational needs, the authors have identified three key strategies to develop a change in CST for curriculum planners and policy makers.</p>
Suggested Reviewers:	Afonso M. Cavaco acavaco@campus.ul.pt Dr Cavaco is an expert in communication skills education. He have many studies on communication skills in pharmacy.
	Naoko Arakawa Naoko.Arakawa@nottingham.ac.uk
	Matthew Boyd Matthew.Boyd@nottingham.ac.uk
Opposed Reviewers:	
Response to Reviewers:	



**University of
Nottingham**

UK | CHINA | MALAYSIA

**Division of Pharmacy Practice and Policy
School of Pharmacy**

The University of Nottingham
University Park
Nottingham
NG7 2RD

1
2
3
4
5
6 Dear Shane Desselle, RPh, PhD, FAPhA,,

7 We would like to request you to consider the attached manuscript entitled "A CALL TO
8 CHANGE IN COMMUNICATION SKILLS TRAINING IN TURKEY: COMPARISION WITH THE
9 UK" for publication in *Currents in Pharmacy Teaching and Learning* as a commentary.

10
11 Dr. Gulpinar has been conducting her postdoc researches at the University of Nottingham
12 on communication skills in pharmacy. She had some observations on the way of offering
13 communication skills training in the University of Nottingham. Her PhD thesis was also
14 about communication skills training and she had developed a course and implemented it
15 to the students at Ankara University during her PhD. However, while she was doing her
16 postdoc researches at the University of Nottingham under my supervision, she mentioned
17 that she realized offering communication skills training in a discipline based environment
18 like in Turkey would not give chance to students to gain these skills and has to be changed
19 rapidly. We have some suggestions for stakeholders to how to change the curriculum
20 throughout the world. These strategies could pave the way of other trainers throughout
21 the world who are trying to create their communication skills training in an integrated
22 environment.

23
24
25
26 Additionally, this paper presents a comparison of both the current situation of pharmacy
27 practices and communication skills training in Turkey and the UK, which can be an essential
28 reference for academics. There is no paper comparing these two fields between two
29 countries, one of has a high standard and one of is a developing country. We have not
30 come across any paper representing the current situation of pharmacy practices and
31 communication skills training in Turkey. One of the most significant part of this paper is to
32 establish the connection between communication skills training and the practice
33 environment where the pharmacists have a chance to use these skills by comparing with
34 a developed country. In addition, we have presented the structure of the fully integrated
35 curriculum of University of Nottingham, vertical and horizontal themes, as to set a model
36 for the curriculum planners for their future designs.

37
38
39
40 We prefer this journal because of the fact that the journal has a broad range of readers
41 and it can give authors a greater chance to reach targeted population who will benefit. We
42 believe that the content of the commentary is relevant to the scope of your journal and
43 will be of interest to its readership. We have provided a figure summarizing the way of CST
44 in the University of Nottingham which can be a good resource for other researchers who
45 need to examine the structure of the integrated curriculum as well. We exceeded the word
46 limit of commentary papers in terms of the rules of your journal. However, we need your
47 flexibility for this paper as we need to fully explain the structure of Turkey and our way of
48 offering course to make an impact on the curriculum planners to come to a change.

49
50
51 Do let us know if you wish to have a look at the paper.

52
53 This manuscript has not been published elsewhere in part or in entirety, and is not under
54 consideration by another journal. There are no conflicts of interest to declare. All the
55 authors have read the manuscript and agreed to submit it to that journal.

56
57 We look forward to hearing from you.

58 Sincerely,

59
60 Claire Anderson, BPharm, PhD, FRPharmS, FFRPS, FFIP, FRSPH

61 Professor of Social Pharmacy
62
63
64
65

Dear reviewers,

We reviewed the manuscript according your recommendations. We addressed all issues that are marked prior to resubmission:

- 1- The reason why we chose UK as the comparator region was explained on pg2 line5.
- 2- The grammatical errors were corrected both on the specified pages and throughout the manuscript.
- 3- The main element was expressed by altering the structure of the sentence on pg3 line2-3.
- 4- GPhC was explained on pg4 line1-3.
- 5- The study revealing the poor communication skills of pharmacists were explained in a clear way on pg7 line 23-27 and pg8 line 1-2.
- 6- We carefully reviewed the manuscript against the guidelines provided in the Copy Editing Checklist once more.

A CALL TO AN URGENT ACTION TO CHANGE IN THE CURRICULUM ON COMMUNICATION SKILLS FOR PHARMACY UNDERGRADUATES IN TURKEY: A COMPARISON WITH THE UK

Gizem Gülpınar^a, Claire Mann^b, Claire Anderson^b

Gizem Gulpinar, MPharm, PhD

Department of Pharmacy Management, Faculty of Pharmacy, Ankara University, 06100, Turkey

Phone: +90 536 540 20 61

gizem.gulpinar@nottingham.ac.uk

Claire Mann, PhD

Senior Research Fellow

Division of Pharmacy Practice and Policy, School of Pharmacy, University of Nottingham, NG72RD, UK

C.Mann@nottingham.ac.uk

Claire Anderson, BPharm, PhD, FRPharmS, FFRPS, FFIP, FRSPH

Professor Professor of Social Pharmacy

Division of Pharmacy Practice & Policy, School of Pharmacy, University of Nottingham NG72RD, UK

Claire.Anderson@nottingham.ac.uk

Phone: +44 1159515389

Abstract

Introduction: Globally, pharmacy undergraduate programs are evolving to reflect a more patient-centered approach to clinical practice. The importance of teaching communication skills in any undergraduate pharmacy curriculum cannot be overstated. This paper aims to shed a light on the way forward by comparing current literature and practices related to pharmacy services and CST in pharmacy undergraduate education in the UK and Turkey and discusses the need for an urgent change in the curriculum on CST in Turkey. Additionally, it provides potential strategies for improving the quality of CST and for expanding pharmacy practice to ensure students and graduates are motivated to use communication skills.

Commentary: The concept of traditionally structured curriculum with the basic sciences components in the early years and clinical experiences in the later years should be changed into an integrated environment where CST could be offered more effectively. CST offered at the University of Nottingham could be considered as a framework.

Implications: To meet patient care and educational needs, the authors have identified three key strategies to develop a change in CST for curriculum planners and policy makers.

Key words: communication skills training; integrated curriculum; pharmacy education; community pharmacy

There are no conflicts of interest to declare.

There are no financial conflicts of interest to disclose.

There is one figure in this commentary. The caption of the figure is “The curriculum design at the University of Nottingham”.

Contribution to literature

This paper is a comparison of both the pharmacy practices and communication skills training in Turkey and the UK, which can be an essential reference for academics. There is no paper comparing these two fields between two countries, one of has a high standard and one of is a developing country. The authors have not come across any paper representing the current situation of pharmacy practices and communication skills training in Turkey. One of the most significant part of this paper is establishing the connection between communication skills training and the practice environment where the pharmacists have a chance to use these skills by comparing with a developed country. The authors have been given some suggestions for stakeholders to how to change the curriculum throughout the world for communication skills training. These strategies could pave the way of other trainers who are trying to create their communication skills training in an integrated environment. Additionally, in this paper authors have presented the structure of the fully integrated curriculum of University of Nottingham, vertical and horizontal themes, as to set a model for the curriculum planners for their future designs.

A CALL TO AN URGENT ACTION TO CHANGE IN THE CURRICULUM ON COMMUNICATION SKILLS FOR PHARMACY UNDERGRADUATES IN TURKEY: A COMPARISON WITH THE UK

Abstract

Introduction: Globally, pharmacy undergraduate programs are evolving to reflect a more patient-centered approach to clinical practice. The importance of teaching communication skills in any undergraduate pharmacy curriculum cannot be overstated. This paper aims to shed a light on the way forward by comparing current literature and practices related to pharmacy services and CST in pharmacy undergraduate education in the UK and Turkey and discusses the need for an urgent change in the curriculum on CST in Turkey. Additionally, it provides potential strategies for improving the quality of CST and for expanding pharmacy practice to ensure students and graduates be motivated to use communication skills.

Commentary: The concept of traditionally structured curriculum with the basic sciences components in the early years and clinical experiences in the later years should be changed into an integrated environment where CST could be offered more effectively. CST offered at the University of Nottingham could be considered as a framework.

Implications: To meet patient care and educational needs, the authors have identified three key strategies to develop a change in CST for curriculum planners and policy makers.

Key words: communication skills training; integrated curriculum; pharmacy education; community pharmacy

Introduction

Throughout the world, pharmacy education is experiencing a complete change to develop the practice of pharmacy and improve patient outcomes. Pharmacists are providing advanced services such as collaborative drug therapy management, medication safety systems, and improving transitions of care. Transforming patient care services requires pharmacists to be educated and skilled in communication to support patients' wellbeing. The educational system and professional regulatory bodies should match both people and the capabilities and training of the healthcare providers as regard communication skills training (CST). This need is especially prominent in Turkey.

1 An urgent call for a change in CST in pharmacy undergraduate education is an essential need for Turkey.
2 Hence, it is thought to be beneficial for the curriculum developers to move forward by comparing a
3 developing country like Turkey and the United Kingdom (UK), which has already stepped the way
4 forward in terms of pharmacy services offered, and CST given in undergraduate pharmacy education.
5 The first author was funded by Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey (TUBITAK)
6 to visit University of Nottingham in the UK to study CST and pharmacy practice and to develop some
7 recommendations for the curriculum in Turkey. This paper compares current literature and practices
8 related to pharmacy services and CST in pharmacy undergraduate education in the UK and Turkey and
9 discusses the need for an urgent change in the curriculum on CST in Turkey.

10 **Commentary**

11 **Comparison of pharmacy services in the UK and in Turkey**

12 **An overview of pharmacy services in the UK**

13 In the UK, there are 11,569 community pharmacies and most of their total income comes from the
14 National Health Service (NHS). More than half of (60%) pharmacies are within multiple chains, the
15 remaining 40% run as independents or small chains.¹ The pharmacy profession in the UK has long
16 embraced the idea of public health as a primary area for development, and the government has been
17 eager to involve pharmacists in achieving its public health goals.² Pharmacists providing care to patients
18 can be generally classified as community pharmacists, hospital pharmacists and primary care
19 pharmacists in the UK. Community pharmacy sector employs most of pharmacists.³

20 As mentioned earlier, the focus on dispensing has changed to a more advisory role on patient care within
21 pharmacy practice. The role of the community pharmacist has been enhanced from that of a compounder
22 and dispenser of medicines to that of a provider of clinical services.⁴ All pharmacies are expected to be
23 healthy living pharmacies, providing consistent delivery of wide range of high quality services through
24 community pharmacies to improve the health and wellbeing of the local population and to help to
25 restrain health inequalities is the main of The Healthy Living Pharmacy.⁵

26 **An overview of pharmacy services in Turkey**

1 Comprehensive reviews of the scope and depth of pharmacy practice in Turkey are lacking. However,
2 several recent articles cite experiences in Turkey.^{6,7} Community pharmacists, as those in other parts of
3 the world, are seen some of the most accessible healthcare professionals in Turkey.⁸

4 In Turkey, the number of community pharmacists per 100,000 inhabitants is now 33.1, and this average
5 is close to EU.⁸ There are almost 25000 community pharmacists⁹, each serving, on average, 3000
6 inhabitants. The current Law No. 6197¹⁰ mandates that ownership of a pharmacy is restricted to
7 pharmacists only and, each pharmacist was allowed to manage only one pharmacy. For this reason,
8 chain pharmacies are not allowed in the country. In Turkey, after 2012 with the current Law No. 6308¹¹
9 a restriction on the number and distribution of community pharmacies was launched. To run a pharmacy,
10 a license is required.

11 Only pharmacies can sell medicines to consumers.¹² Community pharmacists do not only distribute
12 medicines, but also provide information about the effects, possible adverse effects, dosing, application,
13 and interactions of medicines. Additionally, advice on life style and healthy living for the population is
14 provided.⁸ Even though this advisory role is included in the pharmacy law¹⁰, the pharmacists provide
15 this services to the public free because there is no funding for pharmacy counselling services in Turkey.
16 Because of that, the community pharmacists in Turkey are mostly dissatisfied with their job.^{6,8}

17 **The importance of CST for global pharmacy services**

18 Together with transition from dispensing medications to advanced services in pharmacy practice
19 throughout the world, effective communication skills for pharmacists become important to help them to
20 deal with their evolving and expanding roles.¹³ In line with this view, CST has become an essential part
21 of the pharmacy curriculum around the world.¹⁴ Since the content of CST can vary by culture, different
22 guidelines can arise for what pharmacy students are expected to learn. That said, counselling patients is
23 considered crucial in virtually all pharmacy curricula.¹⁵ Nevertheless, cultural differences have led to
24 inconsistent communication-based learning outcomes and teaching modalities.¹⁶ This section compares
25 provision in the UK and Turkey.

26 **Current situation of CST in the UK**

1 Before explaining the CST in the UK, it should be understood that the body assuring and improving
2 standards of care for people using pharmacy services known as the General Pharmaceutical Council
3 (GPhC) has set some education standards in 2010. These standards exactly state that the pharmacy
4 curricula “must be integrated”. In the scope of curriculum integration, individual disciplines are
5 strategically merged and the line between the disciplines are blurring to create a cohesive whole as a
6 pharmacist. Horizontal and vertical integration, terms which can be seen regularly in integrated
7 curriculum design, outline the direction of integration.¹⁷ Horizontal integration defines as the integration
8 of knowledge and skills taught at the same level/year of a program. Vertical integration outlines the
9 process of acquiring information used at any one level and continuing until the later years.¹⁸ Both
10 dimensions can further be merged into an integrated spiral curriculum in which the content is designed
11 according to increasing complexity by repeating the topics throughout the years.^{18,19} A pharmacy
12 curriculum might include modules within horizontal themes i.e, the respiratory system, the
13 cardiovascular system, and so on, rather than courses in medicinal chemistry, pharmacology, etc.²⁰

14 **CST in an integrated environment at the University of Nottingham**

15 The integrated pharmacy undergraduate curriculum at the University of Nottingham could be an
16 example of how to provide students a scientific knowledge on managing patients and medicines, using
17 a body system/disease-state approach. This structure is commonly used to develop integrated, spiral
18 curricula.¹⁸ Competency-based design is taken into consideration rather than subject-based. The content
19 progresses from comprehending of single disease states through to management of complex co-morbid
20 situations. Figure 1 outlines the sequencing of body systems/diseases.

21 An important aspect of modules within the undergraduate pharmacy education in the UK is the
22 integration of a large body of science with clinical pharmacy and practice. In integrated, spiral pharmacy
23 undergraduate curricula is comprised of several different and distinct subjects areas which are defined
24 as vertical themes. University of Nottingham determined seven distinct vertical themes including
25 professionalism and leadership in which CST is given under (Figure 1). Each of the major seven vertical
26 themes gradually builds throughout the course so that knowledge is encountered in a logical order across
27 all modules starting at year one, through to graduation. So, for example, the professionalism and

1 leadership vertical theme builds throughout the years, covering the fundamental principles of how a
2 pharmacist will act as in an ethical, legal and effective manner, enhancing the counselling skills
3 especially communication skills, dispensing requirements, leadership skills, and considering ethical
4 issues.

5 The basis of giving CST in an integrated environment is to provide the students with contact with
6 patients earlier in curriculum. Student motivation to develop attitudes including showing empathy,
7 having responsibility towards patients, and recognizing professional identity, has been increased by
8 creating environment enabling students to interact with the patients early in the curriculum.²¹
9 Additionally, certain pedagogic arrangements have the potential to enable integrative CST. Various
10 teaching methods in CST have been identified to be vital including lectures, patient interviews, small
11 group interactions (workshops), video recording and reviewing, and the use of real and simulated
12 patients in the UK. Well-designed case studies embedded problems, and interactive learning methods
13 simulate complex, real-world situations and provide opportunities for students to practice the skill of
14 integrating knowledge across subjects in CST.

15 University of Nottingham offers basic communication skills with lectures and providing an
16 environment, which enables students to encounter with real patients at the first year under the “Essential
17 Skills of Pharmacist” module. When moving on through the years with the basic knowledge of
18 communication skills, i.e. asking question, reflective answering, empathy, the interactions between
19 students and patients, which provide students to use communication skills, is designed in the different
20 modules related to different body functions-disease states. As an example, in the year two “Pain
21 Module” students come across different scenarios created to display pain related issues. Students
22 interview simulated patients according to these pain scenarios, which focus on a clinical-based problem.
23 Additionally, a series of patient narratives were created within the modules as clinical workshops for
24 students to use their scientific knowledge and skills to comprehend clinical situations and improve their
25 clinical and professional practice especially communication skills.²² Integrative assessment methods,
26 including written examination, case-based, and objective structured clinical examinations (OSCEs), are
27 used at the University of Nottingham for CST across the curriculum.

1 **Current situation of CST in Turkey**

2 The pharmacy undergraduate program is mainly structured as discipline-based in Turkey. Division
3 members have shared research interests and are responsible for the courses in their discipline.²³ In 2015,
4 National Core Curriculum for Undergraduate Pharmacy Education (NCCUPE) which is considered as a
5 national framework, including several competencies, has been created for pharmacy students by The
6 Council of the Deans of Faculties of Pharmacy (CDFP) in Turkey.²³ NCCUPE standards are considered
7 as mandatory that all the faculties of pharmacy in Turkey have to adopt their curricula in line with these
8 competencies. It is known that several faculties in Turkey have started to reorganize their curricula in a
9 way that matches these competencies. However, in contrast to the standards of GPhC, NCCUPE has not
10 directly require an integrated experience of science and practice that must be offered in the
11 undergraduate pharmacy education in Turkey.

12 Pharmacy curricula in Turkey are traditionally structured with the components of basic sciences in the
13 early years and clinical experiences in the later years. The courses as well as CST are given in a
14 discipline base and under the responsibility of one discipline in Turkey. For instance, like most of the
15 faculties in Turkey, Ankara University is offering CST in the last year of the undergraduate pharmacy
16 program. The CST course content is structured starting from the basic communication skills through
17 advanced skills to be taught in one semester or in a year. A few pedagogies like case studies and rarely
18 simulated patients are used in CST in Turkey.²⁴ Written examination is the only-known assessment
19 strategy being used to assess students' communication skills in Turkey.²⁵

20 **Implications**

21 To meet the patient care and educational needs of Turkey, the authors have identified three key strategies
22 to develop a change in CST. These strategies can be applied to other regions of the world as well.

23 ***Develop CST to better prepare pharmacists for their role as a part of the health care system in an*** 24 ***integrated environment***

25 The effort mentioned above was started on curricular innovation and transformation at pharmacy
26 programs after the creation of NCCUPE in Turkey. It is known that very few faculties of pharmacy have

1 been trying to transform their pharmacy program into an integrated curriculum in Turkey. In line with
2 these efforts, urgent improvement is needed considering how to offer CST in an integrated environment
3 in Turkey. Offering integrated CST should be considered as introducing communication skills integrated
4 with pharmacy content rather than as a separate skill. It could be used as a method for connecting
5 knowledge between disciplines and provides learning in an environment of patient interaction,
6 facilitated by a clinical placement. Without integration of CST, the risk remains that students might have
7 difficulties integrating communication with science content and skills during patient encounters. It is
8 suggested that a curriculum with more longitudinal CST attains greater increase and retention of skills²⁶.
9 Some challenges might be encountered during the process of creating CST in an integrated environment
10 in terms of educators and students. The most challenging part might be a tension between science and
11 pharmacy practice while designing CST in an integrated environment. Several studies showing science
12 teachers alike have a view of science as a core component of pharmacy education and express personal
13 fears and doubts about the impact of curriculum integration.^{27,28} Despite these challenges, it should not
14 be overlooked that the purpose of integration as a structure and method for curriculum design is to
15 produce better pharmacists rather than to produce graduates who were experts in their own discipline.²⁸

16 ***Define new, improved pedagogies, assessment strategies, and learning environment for CST***

17 Using innovative teaching and assessment techniques especially simulated patients to enrich students'
18 communication skills is still lacking in Turkey, although few attempts has been recognized.²⁹ Using
19 simulated patients provides an opportunity to the students to have more time with patients earlier in the
20 curriculum. As a result, they will feel more confident when communicating with patients when they
21 graduate. Additionally, asking the right question, structuring the consultation, and giving accurate
22 information to the patient needs practicing with patients. The research carried out in Turkey presents a
23 picture of the effects of CST on pharmaceutical services provided⁷. The services of community
24 pharmacists in Istanbul in Turkey, were evaluated in terms of providing adequate written and verbal
25 information to patients by face-to-face interviews. The results indicated pharmacists assumed their
26 communication skills with patients were adequate. On the contrary, the services delivered by
27 pharmacists were seen inadequate according to the evaluation of simulated patient interactions.

1 Pharmacists informed the simulated patients poorly. The reason for this inadequacy might due to the
2 lack of clinical knowledge, as well as poor communication skills of pharmacists. On the contrary, in a
3 study the patients notified positively on their consultation with the pharmacist in the UK. They are
4 making patients feel comfortable by not judging and giving full information to them.³⁰ Experience and
5 learning with patients should be used or expanded as a teaching method in Turkey immediately to meet
6 the competencies set in NCCUPE.

7 As mentioned earlier, written examinations are mostly being used for assessment of pharmacy students
8 in CST in Turkey. Different methods for assessing learning outcomes should be used to determine the
9 extent of student learning and should vary according to year of study. In an integrated curriculum, case-
10 based integrated questions from across each modules of the academic year could be designed. Most
11 importantly, OSCE examination should be implemented and expanded across the country. Some
12 challenges can be considered as significant time, workforce, financial sources, great amount of time
13 sharing with staff, together with willingness of staff are all required to create an innovative teaching and
14 learning environment.¹⁹ Despite these challenges, there are lots of advantages of using these techniques
15 to assess communication skills.^{22,24}

16 ***Redesign the current community pharmacy services in a way creating motivation to use***
17 ***communication skills***

18 Although NCCUPE has set some standards including communication skills for pharmacists in Turkey,
19 the fact that pharmacy practice is different from what is taught at faculties causes confusions in students'
20 minds about what a pharmacist does in the real work environment and the extent of services to be
21 delivered. Students usually find themselves in a dilemma as to whether pharmacy services are formed
22 solely of dispensing or they are also providing advanced services. Students feel disappointed because of
23 this disparity and cannot perform their role effectively as a provider.³¹ Community pharmacists have a
24 predominant role as an owner of a business rather than a healthcare provider. The community
25 pharmacists in Turkey feel pressure to keep their business running due to financial concerns and they
26 prefer to spend less time with patients and provide less counselling service, and thus cannot feel
27 satisfied.⁶ Expecting students to use communication skills gained as a new behaviour needs motivation

1 and a desire to use them. However, presenting lots of obstacles in the workplace environment of
2 community pharmacists in Turkey which hinders patient-centered care will decrease the motivation of
3 students.²⁵ The practice environment of Turkish pharmacist indirectly influences CST and reduces its
4 efficiency. It is understandably frustrating for new graduates to enter into practice in settings that do not
5 fully utilize their advanced training and skills. To ensure the efficiency of CST curriculum designed
6 with this perspective, without doubt, the community pharmacy settings in real life where students have
7 the chance to use communication skills and to observe role models should be restructured and
8 pharmacists should be funded for the consultation services they provide.

9 It has long been recognized in the UK that the method of remuneration based on number of items
10 dispensed needed to be changed to the services provided. Reprofessionalisation campaign have been
11 led by professional bodies through requesting to redefine the roles of community pharmacists in the UK.
12 An aim of the reprofessionalisation is to stop the deskilling of pharmacists and to enhance job
13 satisfaction in the workplace by using their skills and qualifications.³²

14 Changing the way of providing CST has the potential to prepare pharmacists for their role as a part of
15 the health care system in Turkey. While some efforts has been made to improve the quality of
16 undergraduate pharmacy education in Turkey, more still needs more things to be done together with
17 academia, practice, and government to create and improve both CST and the workplace environment
18 which would pave a way to students to more eagerly use communication skills. The comparison of both
19 CST and the community pharmacy settings where communication skills are used between the UK and
20 Turkey might shine a light on the way forward. The authors hope these recommendations serve as a
21 starting point among key stakeholders to communicate about ways to accomplish these goals.

22 **Declaration of interest**

23 None.

24 **References**

- 1 **1.** Anderson C, Sharma R. Primary health care policy and vision for community pharmacy and
2 pharmacists in England. *Pharm Pract (Granada)*. 2020;18(1):1870.
3
4 3 <https://doi.org/10.18549/PharmPract.2020.1.1870>
5
6 4 **2.** Anderson S. Community pharmacy and public health in Great Britain, 1936 to 2006: how a
7 phoenix rose from the ashes. *J Epidemiol Community Health*. 2007;61(10):844-848.
8 5
9 6 10.1136/jech.2006.055442.
10
11 7 **3.** Smith J, Picton C, Dayan M. Now or Never: Shaping pharmacy for the future. Great Britain:
12 The Royal Pharmaceutical Society; 2013.
13
14 8 **4.** Jalal Z, Akhtar S, Finlay K, King K, Goel N, Ward J. Perceptions of UK Community
15 Pharmacists on Current Consultation Skills and Motivational Interviewing as a Consultation
16 Approach: A Qualitative Study. *Pharmacy (Basel)*. 2019;7(2):52. 10.3390/pharmacy7020052.
17
18 9 **5.** PSNC.2020. Services and Commissioning. <https://psnc.org.uk/services-commissioning/>,
19 Accessed 09 April 2020.
20
21 10 **6.** Gülpınar G, Uzun MB, Yalın YY. The effects of Social Security Institution implementations
22 on community pharmacists' job satisfaction: a qualitative study. *TJOB*. 2015;2(1):36-46.
23 11 10.5505/tjob.2015.29591.
24
25 12 **7.** Toklu HZ. The pharmacy practice of community pharmacists in Turkey. *Marmara Pharm J*.
26 2010;1(14):53-60. 10.12991/201014464.
27
28 13 **8.** Cavaco AM, Sozen-Sahne B, Ulutas-Deniz E, Yegenoglu S. Self-medication and non-
29 prescription drug counseling: Illustrating profession uncertainty within Turkish pharmacy
30 practice. *Res Social Adm Pharm*. 2018;14(8):718-726. 10.1016/j.sapharm.2017.09.006.
31
32 14 **9.** Sancar M, Okuyan B, Apikoğlu-Rabuş Ş, İzzettin FV. Opinion and knowledge towards
33 pharmaceutical care of the pharmacists participated in clinical pharmacy and pharmaceutical
34 care continuing education program. *Turk J Pharm Sci*. 2013;10(2):245-254.
35
36 15 **10.** Turkish Official Gazette. 1953. Law on the Pharmacists and Pharmacies No 6197.
37
38 16 <https://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2019/06/20190629-8.htm>, Accessed 14 April 2020.
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

- 1 **11.** Turkish Official Gazette. 2012. Law on Amendment of the Law on the Pharmacists and
2 Pharmacies No.6308. <https://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2012/05/20120531-3.htm>,
3 Accessed 14 April 2020.
- 4 **12.** Tatlıpınar ME, Göksu Y, Omurtag GZ. The role of pharmacists in Kırklareli (Turkey) as
5 primary health care providers. *Acta Pharm Sci.* 2017;55(2):95. 10.23893/1307-
6 2080.APS.05514
- 7 **13.** GPC. Future pharmacists: Standards for the initial education and training of pharmacists:
8 General Pharmaceutical Council; 2011.
- 9 **14.** Jalal Z, Cox A, Goel N, Vaitha N, King K, Ward J. Communications Skills in the Pharmacy
10 Profession: A Cross Sectional Survey of UK Registered Pharmacists and Pharmacy Educators.
11 *Pharmacy (Basel).* 2018;6(4):132. 10.3390/pharmacy6040132.
- 12 **15.** Wallman A, Vaudan C, Sporrang SK. Communications training in pharmacy education, 1995-
13 2010. *Am J Pharm Educ.* 2013;77(2):36. 10.5688/ajpe77236
- 14 **16.** Kerr A, Strawbridge J, Kelleher C, et al. How can pharmacists develop patient-pharmacist
15 communication skills? A realist review protocol. *Syst Rev.* 2017;6(1):14. 10.1186/s13643-016-
16 0396-0.
- 17 **17.** Husband AK, Todd A, Fulton J. Integrating Science and Practice in Pharmacy Curricula. *Am J*
18 *Pharm Educ.* 2014;78(3):Article 63. 10.5688/ajpe78363.
- 19 **18.** Harden RM. What is a spiral curriculum? *Med Teach.* 1999;21(2):141-143.
20 10.1080/01421599979752.
- 21 **19.** Mawdsley A, Willis S. Exploring an integrated curriculum in pharmacy: Students'
22 perspectives on the experienced curriculum and pedagogies supporting integrative learning.
23 *Curr Pharm Teach Learn.* 2019;11(5):450-460. 10.1016/j.cptl.2019.02.006.
- 24 **20** Pearson ML, Hubball HT. Curricular Integration in Pharmacy Education. *Am J Pharm Educ.*
25 2012;76(10):Article 204. 10.5688/ajpe7610204.
- 26 **21.** Littlewood S, Ypinazar V, Margolis SA, Scherpbier A, Spencer J, Dornan T. Early practical
27 experience and the social responsiveness of clinical education: systematic review. *BMJ.*
28 2005;331(7513):387-391. 10.1136/bmj.331.7513.387.

- 1 **22.** De Matteis CI, Randall MD, Harvey EJ, Morris A, Winkler GS, Boardman HF. An Integrated
2 Dyspepsia Module for First-year Pharmacy Students. *Am J Pharm Educ.* 2019;83(1):6508.
3
4 3 10.5688/ajpe6508.
5
6 4 **23.** NCCUPE. 2015. National Core Curriculum for Undergraduate Pharmacy Education.
7
8 5 <http://docplayer.biz.tr/570123-Eczacilik-fakulteleri-icin-kapsamli-mufredat.html>, Accessed 07
9
10 6 May 2020
11
12 7 **24.** Ulutaş Deniz E, Sözen Şahne B, Yeğenoğlu S, Elçin M. Feedback for a simulation practice on
13 communication skills in pharmacy education: A pilot study. *Marmara Pharm J.*
14
15 8 2018;22(2):314-321. 10.12991/mpj.2018.69.
16
17 9
18 10 **25.** Gulpinar G. Pharmacy Education in Turkey From Professional Socialization Perspective. *J Lit*
19
20 11 *Pharm Sci.* 2019;8(3):196-205. 10.5336/pharmsci.2019-66792.
21
22 12 **26.** van Weel-Baumgarten E, Bolhuis S, Rosenbaum M, Silverman J. Bridging the gap: How is
23
24 13 integrating communication skills with medical content throughout the curriculum valued by
25
26 14 students? *Patient Educ Couns.* 2013;90(2):177-183. 10.1016/j.pec.2012.12.004.
27
28 15 **27.** Mawdsley A, Willis S. Exploring an integrated curriculum in pharmacy: Educators'
29
30 16 perspectives. *Curr Pharm Teach Learn.* 2018;10:373-381. 10.1016/j.cptl.2017.11.017.
31
32 17 **28.** Kullgren J, Radhakrishnan R, Unni E, Hanson E. An integrated course in pain management
33
34 18 and palliative care bridging the basic sciences and pharmacy practice. *Am J Pharm Educ.*
35
36 19 2013;77(6):121. 10.5688/ajpe776121.
37
38 20 **29.** Abdi AM, Basgut B. Pharmacy Students' Perception and Evaluation of Objective Structured
39
40 21 Clinical Examination: Near East University Experience. *J Pharm Res Int.* 2019;27(2).
41
42 22 10.9734/jpri/2019/v27i230162.
43
44 23 **30.** Bissell P, Blenkinsopp A, Short D, Mason L. Patients' experiences of a community pharmacy-
45
46 24 led medicines management service. *Health Soc Care Community.* 2008;16(4):363-369.
47
48 25 10.1111/j.1365-2524.2007.00749.x.
49
50 26 **31.** Noble C, Coombes I, Shaw PN, Nissen LM, Clavarino A. Becoming a pharmacist: the role of
51
52 27 curriculum in professional identity formation. *Pharm Pract (Granada).* 2014;12(1):380.
53
54 28 10.4321/S1886-36552014000100007.
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

1 **32.** Edmunds J, Calnan MW. The reprofessionalisation of community pharmacy? An exploration
2 of attitudes to extended roles for community pharmacists amongst pharmacists and General
3 Practitioners in the United Kingdom. *Soc Sci Med* (1982). 2001;53(7):943-955. 10.1016/s0277-
4 9536(00)00393-2.

Figure
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

Vertical Themes

- Biology and Physiology
- Pharmacology and Therapeutics
- Chemistry
- Pharmaceutics
- Absorption, Distribution, Metabolism and Elimination (ADME)
- Clinical and Pharmacy Practice
- Professionalism and Leadership

The name of the modules

- Integrated Pharmaceutical and Patient Care 1
- Advanced Drug Discovery
- Pharmacy Leadership and Management
- Professional Competencies 4
- Integrated Pharmaceutical and Patient Care 2
- Future Medicines
- Viral and Parasitic Infections
- Central Nervous System Disorders
- Cancers
- Professional Competencies 3
- Research Project
- Gastrointestinal and Liver Disorders
- Asthma, Allergies and Immune Diseases
- Cardiovascular
- Renal and Endocrine Diseases Sexual Health and Pregnancy
- Pain
- Professional Competencies 2
- Being a Pharmacist
- Essential Skills for Pharmacists
- Professional Competencies 1
- Dyspepsia
- Bacterial and Fungal Infections

Year 4

Year 3

Year 2

Year 1

Horizontal Themes

