#### Waldensians in Southern France and 'the time when the Church did not pursue Waldensians'.

#### 1. Introduction

The Waldensian heresy emerged in Burgundy in the 1170s and was anathematised as early as 1184, before it had spread very far. But in southern France, there was a widely acknowledged 'time when the Church did not pursue Waldensians'. This was suggested in 1244 by an inquisitorial deponent of Moissac, a town in the diocese of Cahors and medieval county of Quercy, called Pérégrine Gasc.<sup>1</sup> She is referring to her experience of Waldensians in the town of Toulouse and elsewhere in the period before 1230, which is to say, before the birth of the medieval inquisition. What she meant was, that she followed them before anyone told her that it wrong. They had operated relatively freely and openly before then. Once expelled from Lyons, where it first emerged, and having been anathematised and excommunicated by Pope Lucius III's decree *Ad abolendam* in 1184, the vast historical Waldensian diaspora had begun to take shape. Not least, the illegal sect had flourished unopposed for some decades to the north of the Pyrenees.

Pérégrine's approach had already been taken by James Carbonnel of nearby Montauban in 1241. He had 'believed them to be good people up until the time when the Church had condemned them'.<sup>2</sup> Although he was not entirely believed by the inquisitor, that such excuses might conceivably be acceptable is illustrative of the fact that *Ad abolendam* had only been implemented with any success only where secular rulers were opponents of heresy,<sup>3</sup> which was far from the case

<sup>2</sup> Duvernoy, J. (ed. and trans.), *L'inquisition en Quercy: le registre des pénitences de Pierre Cellan,* 1241-1242 (Castelnaud la Chapelle, 2001), pp. 132-3.

<sup>3</sup> Lambert, M. D, *Medieval Heresy: Popular Movements from the Gregorian Reform to the Reformation*, 3rd edn. (Oxford, 2003), p. 76.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The deposition containing the phrase 'tunc temporis Ecclesia non persequebatur Valdenses' was made in the court of the inquisitor Bernard of Caux and is in the archive of the Bibliothèque nationale de France, mss. Lat. Fonds Doat 22, fols. 27r-9r (for this witness, see f. 30r-v). It inspired Jean Duvernoy's article, '"À l'époque, l'Église ne poursuivait pas les Vaudois": éssai de chronologie du valdéisme languedocien', in his *Dissidents du Pays d'oc: Cathares, Vaudois et Béguins* (Toulouse, 1994), pp. 153-61. See also Brenon, A., 'Vaudoisie en Languedoc (xiie-xiv siècles)', in her *Le choix hérétique. Dissidence chrétienne dans l'Europe médiévale* (Cahors, 2006), pp. 115-30, at 123. On the Doat collection, see below.

in Southern France. By c.1300, however, it was known only too well that the sectarians were 'heretics' and that there were severe penalties for involvement with them. Bérard d'Alièze of Astarac discovered this in 1319. In the court of the inquisitor Bernard Gui, he admitted to having associated and prayed with them, whilst knowing that the Church was hunting them.<sup>4</sup> Others, such as a woman called Ponia, who had made her confession to a Waldensian apparently believing him to be a 'proper priest', were in a small minority, or were playing a dangerous game with the inquisitor.<sup>5</sup>

When Waldensians had first arrived in southern France, specifically the Languedoc, they would have found it under the influence of other heretics, called Cathars by historians and some contemporaries. They denied key tenets of Christianity such as the creation of the World by God, the human incarnation of Christ, and asserted the existence of two gods, one good and one evil. The characteristics of Languedoc traditionally held up by historians as an explanation for the success of Catharism, may work equally well for Waldensians. These include an interrelated combination of factors such as the unwillingness and inability of both local clerics and nobles to take action against dissident religious ideas, a deeply-felt and actively hostile anticlericalism in lay circles at all social levels, and a tolerant attitude toward large-scale public preaching in the region's fortified *castra* and cosmopolitan towns.

Waldensians, all-but orthodox in comparison, opposed Cathars vociferously in preaching and in debate. They presumably chose to migrate to southern France specifically in order to do this. It has been assumed by historians of Waldensianism that because of this activity, they were initially tolerated by the Occitan clergy, and that it was only after the French crown took control of the region in 1229, after the end of the Albigensian Crusade against Catharism (1209-29), that they were significantly persecuted.<sup>6</sup> This is what Pérégrine Gasc is possibly alluding to, although we have no evidence of a formal policy of toleration, whatever pragmatic approaches were taken informally. Unlicensed preaching, against Catharism or otherwise, was largely what defined their heresy in the first place, and no permission was granted by southern French bishops. *Ad abolendam* would have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Pales-Gobillard, A. (ed. and trans), *Le Livre des sentences de l'inquisitor Bernard Gui, 1308-28*, 2 vols. (Paris, 2002), II, pp. 984-7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> *ibid*. pp. 1024-5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> For example in G. Audisio, *Preachers by Night: The Waldensian Barbes (15<sup>th</sup>-16<sup>th</sup> Centuries),* trans. Claire Davidson (Leiden and Boston, 2007), pp. 12-13.

ruled this out in any case. Rather, local and clerical sources concerning the south denounced them from c. 1190 at the latest, and they were persecuted in the Crusade era and afterwards.

Nonetheless, all parties considered them less dangerous than Cathars. Thus, in the record relating to the investigation of the Cathar adherent Peter Garcias of Toulouse in 1247, we hear of an imprisoned Waldensian called Peter Desplas. Peter Garcias regarded him as less heretical than Cathars, and as 'honest, wise and of good judgement', yet he was 'locked out of sight'.<sup>7</sup> The transformation of the sect from being a passively and informally tolerated popular movement against Catharism, into a sect of heretics who inquisitors would burn, will now be traced through the sources.

### 2. Medieval sources for Waldensian History in Languedoc.

### **Early narrative accounts**

Soon after the decrees of *Ad abolendam* were made known, Archbishop Bernard-Gaucelin of Narbonne convened a synod which condemned Waldensians and launched an enquiry into the sect. Bernard of Foucaude (or Fontcaude) tells us that a debate was arranged, just before 1190.<sup>8</sup> He calls Waldensians, 'the ravening wolves' and 'demon-heretics and tyrants', who must be driven from 'the folds of Christ's sheep' either by preaching or by 'the rod of discipline or strictness'.<sup>9</sup> The group advanced arguments based on Scripture, and Bernard wrote in order to arm clergy with relatively little education or access to books, with arguments that they could use against them. In particularly resented their (mis)appropriation of Acts 5:29, which states that Christians should obey God rather

<sup>7</sup> Léglu, C., Rist, R. and Taylor, C. eds. and trans. *The Cathars and the Albigensian Crusade* (London/New York, 2014), p. 167.

<sup>8</sup> Bernardi abbatis Fontis callidi ordinis praemonstratensis, Adversus Waldensium sectam liber, in PL CCIV, 793-840 is partially translated in W. L. Wakefield and A. P. Evans, eds. and trans., *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* (New York/Oxford, 1969, 1991), pp. 211-13. Bernard's Premonstratensian abbey lay just north of Narbonne, and he wrote between 1190 and 1193. See Verees, L., 'Le traité de l'abbé Bernard de Foucaude contre les Vaudois et les Arians', *Analecta Praemonstratensia* 31 (1955), 5-35. See also Thouzellier, C. *Catharisme et Valdéisme en Languedoc à la fin du xiie et au début de xiiie siècle* (Paris, 1969), pp. 49-59; Cameron, *Waldenses*, pp. 24-5.

<sup>9</sup> Wakefield and Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, p. 212.

than man. As well as their insistence on preaching, which they justified using biblical and other texts, Bernard claims that they did not believe in purgatory, prayers and other acts for the dead, rejected praying in churches, and refused to obey Catholic clergy. A judge, Raymond of Deventer, ruled that they were indeed heretics.

The Paris theologian Alan of Lille was the first of the great twelfth-century scholars of heresy to discuss the sect in southern France. Sometime between 1180 and 1202, he attributes criminal tenets to Waldensians, dualists, Jews and Muslims. It is one of the most robust attacks on Valdes' followers and its widespread distribution implies that it was influential. The points addressed include that Waldensians considered that they did not need to obey prelates, although some obeyed good ones, that the power to bind and loose came only from those following the Apostolic way, including themselves, and that they considered lies and oaths to be mortal sins. We do need to be cautious. Alan hints that they were heading in a Donatist direction, which is unlikely at this point.<sup>10</sup> Our first two sources certainly reflect something of what twelfth-century Waldensianism was, but also reflect some of what clerics thought they knew about it, or knew about Waldensians elsewhere.

### **The Poor Catholics**

Upheaval followed the alleged schism of 1205. One of the pivotal moments for southern French Waldensianism was a debate in 1207 at Pamiers, in the Pyrennean county of Foix, whose comital family actively protected both Cathars and Waldensians. The chroniclers Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay and William of Puylaurens both tell us about it. The debate involved Bishop Diego of Osma, who had been undertaking a preaching tour against Cathars with Dominic Guzman (the future St. Dominic). Diego was confident enough in the outcome to allow the arbitrator to be Master Arnold of Crampagna, a Waldensian sympathiser. Peter tells us that the sectarians were 'plainly worsted and confounded', and that Master Arnold renounced the sect and entered Diego's service. Several of the sectarians themselves were formally reconciled with the Church. They were led by Durand of Huesca.<sup>11</sup> The defectors were allowed to form a new religious group, the Society of the Poor

<sup>11</sup> *The Chronicle of William of Puylaurens. The Albigensian Crusade and its Aftermath*, ed. and trans. W. A. and M. D. Sibly (Woodbridge, 2003), pp. 23-5; Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay, *The History of the* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Alani de Insulis De fide catholica contra haereticos sui temporis, PL 210, cols. 305-430, esp. 377-80. Some relevant passages are translated in Wakefield and Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, pp. 214-220. For Alan on Waldensians, see Thouzellier, *Catharisme et Valdéisme*, pp. 94-106. On Alan's problematic chapters, see also Cameron, *Waldenses*, pp. 25-6, 33.

Catholics, which promised to undertake preaching missions – licensed, naturally - and other activity against Cathars. In 1208 they made a declaration of faith, the *Propositum vitae*, based closely on that of the sect's founder at Lyon, known as Valdes. <sup>12</sup> This included that the sacraments are effective whether or not a priest has sinned: 'the wickedness of a bishop or of a priest has no harmful effect upon the baptism of children, nor on the celebration of the Eucharist, nor on the performance of other ecclesiastical offices...'. Furthermore, that only an ordained priest can and should perform the sacraments, and preaching was praiseworthy only under the authority of the pope or bishops. The group declared their orthodoxy in terms of what Waldensians saw as illegitimate recent innovations, for example that masses and other good works could benefit the faithful dead. They also promised that they would confound heretics, through preaching, disputation or exhortation, and oppose them until death. As such, the declaration assumes an active responsibility for countering heresy not merely for lay rulers, as did *Ad abolendam*, but for ordinary Christians as well. The group also affirmed the key tenets of Catholicism and stressed their attachment to the Roman Church and took vows of poverty and chastity as extreme as those of Waldensians. They were given permission to live under a rule. <sup>13</sup>

The Poor Catholics included three other well-educated Waldensian companions. They were John of Narbonne, Bernard of Béziers and Ermengard of Béziers. Ermengard wrote a treatise against heresy, *Contra haereticos*, between 1200-1210,<sup>14</sup> and a description of Cathars which also discusses the

Albigensian Crusade, eds. and trans. W. A. and M. D. Sibly (Oxford, 1998), pp. 26-8, at 27. See also Cameron, Waldenses, pp. 27-8, 34-5.

<sup>12</sup> *PL*, CCXV, 1510-13 and CCXVI, 75-77, translated as 'The establishment of the society of Poor Catholics', in Wakefield and Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, pp. 222-6.

<sup>13</sup> Innocenti III romani pontificis Regestorum sive epistolarum libri XV, xi. 196, also in *PL* 215, cols. 1510-13, translated Wakefield and Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, pp. 222-6. The literature on this process is the most extensive concerning southern-French Waldensians. See, for example, Kurt-Victor Selge's, 'L'aile droite du movement vaudois et naissance des Pauvres catholiques et des Pauvres réconciliés', *Cahiers de Fanjeaux 2, Vaudois languedociens et Pauvres Catholiques* (Toulouse, 1967), pp. 227-43, and M.-H. Vicaire 'Les Vaudois et Pauvres catholiques contre les Cathares (1190-1223), in *ibid*. pp. 244-72. See also Cameron, *Waldenses*, pp. 34-5, 50-5.

<sup>14</sup> *PL* 204, cols. 1,235-72 and *PL* 178, cols. 1823-46. See Thouzellier, C., 'Le 'Liber antiheresis'', 130-41.

Waldensian sect, composed between 1208 and 1213.<sup>15</sup> Euan Cameron suggests that defection to the Catholic Church on the part of such gifted men depleted the Waldensian sect significantly, not only terms of numbers but through an 'intellectual proletarianisation'.<sup>16</sup> Ermengaud observes that Waldensians could not be wholly extirpated except by the secular arm. This implies a very hostile relationship between Waldensians and the new group.

Perhaps because they shone a light on the sorts of clerical practices which had inclined people toward heresy in the first place, the Poor Catholics made enemies of other Catholics too. As early as 1209, complaints made against them in southern France, included that they disputed the passing of death sentences and were not loyal to ordained clergy. Local bishops were clearly jealous of their successes and resented their prestige. Pope Innocent III wrote to Durand of Huesca on this matter in 1209, but also warned the bishops against undermining these prized converts.<sup>17</sup>

### **Crusader sources**

It is unclear how successful the Poor Catholics were in their work against Waldensianism by the time of the Albigensian Crusade. After the defection of Durand and his group, they had become more radical. <sup>18</sup> They were certainly still visible enough for crusade chroniclers to note them. One of these was the young Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay, who journeyed south from his abbey in the Isle de France in 1209. He says far less about Waldensians than he does about Cathars, and possibly based some of it on Ermengard of Béziers. He notes of the origins of the sect that, 'they agree with us in many matters'. The four areas of difference he notes are their presumption in wearing of sandals like the Apostles, their refusal to swear oaths, their condemnation of the taking of life, and that in

<sup>15</sup> Thouzellier, Christine (ed.), *Une somme anti-cathare: le* Liber contra Manicheos *de Durand de Huesca* (Louvain, 1964). For the translation (from an earlier edition) and attribution, see Wakefield and Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, pp. 230-5, with Waldensians at pp. 234-5.

<sup>16</sup> Cameron, *Waldenses*, pp. 68-9, at p. 68.

<sup>17</sup> *Innocenti III romani pontificis...libri XV*, xii. 69, also in *PL* 216, cols. 75-7. The translation is in Wakefield and Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, pp. 226-28.

<sup>18</sup> Cameron notes a likely connection. There may have been serious disagreements within the sect after 1205, concerning which the debate in 1207 was only the deciding factor : Cameron, *Waldenses*, pp. 27, 33-5, 50-3.

dire need they would administer the Eucharist to each other, even without ordination.<sup>19</sup> However, a local source narrating the crusade mentions them only in passing, and in the context of the crusade's overriding and generalised objective; ridding the south of Cathars, Waldensians and mercenaries. This source is known as *the Song of the Albigenasian Crusade and* was composed in the vernacular, Occitan, by two troubadours, William of Tudela and his anonymous continuator.<sup>20</sup>

The final narrative relating to the crusade is that of William of Puylaurens, mentioned above. It was composed in the 1270s. William was a southern notary who later worked in the service of Count Raymond VII of Toulouse and then of the inquisitors. Like the authors of the *Song*, he groups Waldensians with other heretics, noting that 'ignorant priests' had sometimes welcomed their presence because they disputed effectively with other heretics.<sup>21</sup>

#### Inquisitorial evidence

The next set of sources relate to inquisition. The earliest of the texts generated by inquisition exist in the same format as the deposition of Pérégrine Gasc, above, in the Doat collection, held in the Bibliothèque nationale. This is a vast series of seventeenth-century transcriptions of medieval materials, including those relating to the inquisition, the originals of which are lost. Doats 21-26 contain registers of documents including witness depositions, translated from vernacular oral testimony into third person Latin. They typically begin, '[name and family identification], required to speak the truth about themselves and others, both living and dead, about the crime of heresy and Waldensianism...'. In them we have both brief and very lengthy and detailed accounts of religious and other activity relating to Cathars and Waldensians and the communities in which they operated

<sup>20</sup> La Chanson de la Croisade Albigeoise, 3 vols., ed. and French trans. E. Martin-Chabot (Paris, 1960-72). The English translation is J. Shirley, *The Song of the Cathar Wars* (Aldershot, 1996).

<sup>21</sup> Chronica magistri Guillelmi de Podio Laurentii, ed. J. Duvernoy (Paris, 1976). The English edition is The Chronicle of William of Puylaurens: The Albigensian Crusade and its Aftermath, trans. W. A. and M. D. Sibly (Woodbridge, 2003), at p. 8. On William, see Y. Dossat, 'A propos du chroniqueur Guillaume de Puylaurens', in his Église et héresie en France au xiii siècle (London, 1982), pp. 47-52 and 'Le chroniqueur Guillaume de Puylaurens était-il chapelain de Raymond VII ou notaire de l'inquisition toulousaine?', in *idem*, pp. 343-53.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> The Latin edition is *Hystoria Albigensis*, ed. P. Guébin and E. Lyon, 2 vols. (Paris, 1926-30). The full English translation is cited above, here at p. 14. On sandals, see Cameron, *Waldenses*, p. 32.

and drew their support. Whilst problematic as a genre, they offer a unique opportunity to the historian of heresy. As Peter Biller put it, on the question of the renunciation of property, a characteristic they shared with Fransiscans, for whom we have bulls and treatises but not depositions, 'we can learn about Franciscans *theorizing* about poverty, and Waldensians *living* poverty'.<sup>22</sup>

Peter Seilan's register

The earliest surviving register is contained in Doat 21 and dates to 1241-2.<sup>23</sup> It contains hundreds of summaries of heretical crimes and punishments awarded by the Dominican Peter Seilan during his investigations in the diocese of Cahors. Like all inquisitors, Peter Seilan was careful to distinguish Waldensians from Cathars. When the evidence indicated that someone had given or shared food with heretics, for example, he asked whether this involved meat and cheese. Examples of the answers elicited are the cases of Raymond Fournier, who admitted to giving two cheeses to Waldensians, and Huguette Maury, who gave them a cheese preserved in oil.<sup>24</sup> Cathars, vegan except for sometimes eating fish, would not touch these foodstuffs, so these details told the inquisitor which sect the witness had been involved with.

Typical of the inquisitor's shaping of the evidence in Doat 21 is this summary of the crimes of Peter Bacou of Montauban. It begins, 'Peter Bacou saw Waldensians many times and gave them alms,

<sup>22</sup> 'Interrogation of Waldensians', in ed. M. Rubin, *Medieval Christianity in Practice* (Princeton/Oxford, 2009), pp. 231-37, at p. 236 (author emphasis).

<sup>23</sup> Bibliothèque national de France Ms. Lat. Doat 21, fols. 185r-312v. The modern edition is Duvernoy, *L'inquisition en Quercy* (above). Some depositions are translated in English in Léglu, Rist and Taylor, *The Cathars*, pp. 131-77. See also Feuchter, J., 'Pierre Sellan. Le pouvoir de l'inquisition à travers ses peines. Le cas de Montauban (1241)', in *Inquisition et pouvoir*, ed. G. Audisio (Aix-en-Provence, 2003), pp. 235-255 and his 'Pierre Sellan, un viellard expérimenté', in *Les inquisiteurs*. *Portraits de défenseurs de la foi en Languedoc (xiiie-xive siècles)*, ed. L. Albaret (Toulouse, 2001), pp. 41-55. On the manuscripts as having formed part of the Dominican archive in Toulouse, see most recently, Biller, P., Bruschi, C. and Sneddon, S., *Inquisitors and Heretics in Thirteenth-Century Languedoc. Edition and Translations of Toulouse Inquisition Depositions, 1273-1282* (Leiden, 2010), pp. 4-10.

<sup>24</sup> For example, Duvernoy, *L'inquisition en Quercy*, pp. 138-9, 154-5.

listened to Waldensian preaching, loved them and believed that they were good men', which is a commonplace and formulaic phrase appearing in evidence relating to both sects. It continues that he, 'often gave them things'. He was present at the Waldensians' 'Supper', a ritual apparently unique to the Waldensians of Languedoc. He also gave Waldensians food in his home, attended a debate 'between heretics and Waldensians', and 'gave them twenty pennies'. But he also 'consumed bread, wine and fish of the heretics [i.e. Cathars] and accepted the [Kiss of] Peace from them'. This latter activity explains the severity of the penalty; five pilgrimages, to be made at his own expense, to Le Puy, Saint-Gilles, Santiago de Compostela, Canterbury, and Saint-Denis'.<sup>25</sup>

The sheer volume of entries in Doat 21 allows us to make statistically-valid observations about the details which Peter Seilan thought significant enough concerning Waldensians to record.<sup>26</sup> It reveals that the extent of Waldensian impact in Quercy has been underestimated. This is particularly the case at Montauban, where one hundred and thirty people admitted only to involvement with Waldensians, and thirty five with both sects, compared with eighty one who only associated with Cathars. This is to say, Waldensian activity appears to have been more extensive, and demonstrably involved more people. Whilst it is possible that people only admitted to involvement with the less dangerous sect, the inquisitors were thorough and frequently recalled witnesses already dismissed if subsequent interviews cast doubt on their earlier declarations. A data set of this scale allows us to be relatively confident of the statistics.

Statistical work on penances reveals even more detailed patterns. Most typically, punishments consisted of pilgrimages to sites ranging from relatively local cults, such as Saint-Gilles, to further afield. Punishments often involved support of paupers and the wearing of cloth crosses. We can also see, that although the pilgrimages which supporters of Cathars and Waldensians are different in terms of the distances travelled, they are not remarkably so. Eighty-five percent of Waldensian supporters and sixty-one percent of Cathar supporters were sent to three, relatively close destinations; Le Puy, Saint-Gilles and Santiago. The data shows this to be the default sentence for relatively minimal involvement, and in general Waldensian supporters did not receive the harshest penalties unless they had been involved in ritual activity. More distant sites - Canterbury, Rome, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Léglu *et al., The Cathars,* no. 3.1.2, p. 140.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> See Aussel, M., 'Noël 1241: Gourdon au temps de l'inquisition', Bulletin de la société des études du Lot,117 (1996), 91-117; Duvernoy, J., L'inquisition en Quercy, pp. 23, 25; Taylor, C., Heresy, Crusade and Inquisition in Medieval Quercy (Woodbridge, 2011), esp. pp. 160-5.

even Constantinople in the service the Fourth Crusade - were only to be visited by the most serious of criminals, between one and six percent of those sentenced, and were far more likely to be allocated to Cathar *credentes* (believers) than to Waldensian supporters. Even so, fifty-two of the latter were sent to Canterbury. So, penances awarded to those involved in Waldensian activities were far from minimal, irrespective of the relatively moderate belief crimes.<sup>27</sup>

Other thirteenth-century inquisitorial documents.

Between 1242 and c. 1290, and outside of Quercy, we have fewer references to Waldensians. Doat 22, containing Pérégrine Gasc's deposition, is the register of the inquisitor Bernard of Caux.<sup>28</sup> During 1243-5, he and fellow inquisitor John of Saint-Pierre spent eighteen months in the Northern Toulousain and its intersections with Quercy and the Agenais. His register consists of fuller, far lengthier versions of depositions than Peter Seilan's register does. Waldensians appear to have been more marginal, with relatively few cases aside from those discussed below. The town library of Toulouse itself houses one of the few inquisition records dating from the thirteenth century. Ms 609, as it is known, features Waldensians, if marginally, and translated extracts have been published by Biller.<sup>29</sup> Inquisitors' manuals relating to southern France drawn up in 1248-9, by Bernard of Caux and John of Sainte-Pierre,<sup>30</sup> and an anonymous editor in c.1265,<sup>31</sup> are structured to deal separately with Cathars and Waldensians.

<sup>28</sup> Doat 22, ff. 1r-69v. See Y. Dossat, 'L'inquisiteur Bernard de Caux et l'Agenais', in Église et hérésie en France au xiii siècle (London, 1982), pp. 75-9, and 'Une figure d'inquisiteur: Bernard de Caux', Cahiers de Fanjeaux, 6 (Toulouse, 1971), pp. 253-72, also in Église et hérésie, at pp. 47-52

<sup>29</sup> Biller, P., 'Interrogation of Waldensians', in ed. M. Rubin, *Medieval Christianity in Practice* (Princeton/Oxford, 2009), pp. 231-37.

<sup>30</sup> See also Dondaine, A., 'Le manuel de l'inquisiteur (1230-1330)', AFP 17 (1947), 85-194, at pp. 97-101; Sackville, Heresy and Heretics in the Thirteenth Centuary. The Textual Representations (Woodbridge, 2011), pp. 136, 141.

<sup>31</sup> Selge, *Texte zur Inquisition* (Gütersloh, 1967), pp. 70-7, translated in Wakefield and Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, pp. 250-58; Vat. Lat. 3978 is translated in E. Peters (ed.), *Heresy and Authority in Medieval Europe* (London, 1980), no. 40. See also Dondaine, A., 'Le manuel de

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> I am grateful to Dr. Harry Barmby for this data.

Other glimpses come from the registers of Pons of Parnac and Ranulph of Plassac (1273-82), copied into Doats 25 and 26. They are the depositions of six Burgundians living in the diocese of Rodez. Yves Dossat used material on Bernard Raymond Barahon, of a merchant family at Toulouse, who briefly discussed Waldensians, apparently without believing in them.<sup>32</sup> Probably from the 1270s-80s, in *On the Way of life of the Poor of Lyon*, we read that:

'In this sect both men and women are received, and they are called 'Brothers' and 'Sisters'. They do not possess any immovable goods, but they renounce their own property and follow poverty. They do not work, and they do not acquire or earn anything by which they could be supported, but they are supported by the good and alms of their friends and believers...They [the Brothers] live in houses and households, two or three in a hospice with two or three women [the Sisters], who pretend to be their wives or sisters'.<sup>33</sup>

The Dominicans also had their activities recorded in narratives. William of Puylaurens is noted above. A chronicler even more closely associated with the Dominicans' activity was William Pelhisson. He was an inquisitor himself in and his chronicle, whilst not detailed, notes early inquisitorial activity about which we would not otherwise know. This includes an early instance of exhumation, in 1231, of the body of one 'Galvin', an *Archimandrita magnus Valdensium*. Dominicans and others, he tells us, 'went confidently to the house where the said heretic had died, and destroyed it utterly, and made a dung –pit out of it, and they exhumed the said Galvan and took him out of the cemetery of Villeneuve, where he had been buried. In a great procession they dragged his body through the town, and in a public place outside of the town they burned it'. <sup>34</sup>

l'inquisiteur (1230-1330)', *AFP* 17 (1947), 85-194, at pp. 97-101, 106-7, 140-54; Sackville, *Heresy and Heretics in the Thirteenth Centuary. The Textual Representations* (Woodbridge, 2011), pp. 136-8, 141-3.

<sup>32</sup> The excellent edition and English translation is Biller *et al., Inquisitors and Heretics* (above), pp. 33, 194-9, 578-91. This recent edition contains extensive introductory material, of relevance to all inquisition registers. See also Dossat, Y., 'Les Vaudois méridionaux d'après les documents de l'inquisition', *Cahiers de Fanjeaux* 2 (Toulouse, 1967), pp. 207-42, at 221.

<sup>33</sup> Biller, 'Interrogations of Waldensians', p. 234.

<sup>34</sup> Chronique de Guillaume Pelhisson, ed. and trans. J. Duvernoy (Paris, 1994), at pp. 42-4.

#### **Jacques Fournier**

The best known inquisition register is that of another local Dominican, Jacques Fournier, recording depositions from 1318-25 in the county of Foix, because it formed the basis of Emanuel Le Roy Ladurie's famous microhistory, *Montaillou*.<sup>35</sup> However, whereas the central figures in Montaillou were associated with a debased form of Catharism, by then in its death-throws, the register also records a tiny but very coherent Waldensian cell at Pamiers, seized in 1319. Fournier is only known to have executed five people in his career and, remarkably, four of these were from this group. Those arrested had been amongst Waldensians sharing a house in the town. They were questioned, and also despatched to Avignon for interrogation by the inquisitor Bernard Gui. They were Raymond of Sainte-Foy (also called Raymond de la Côte, in the Isère, diocese of Vienne, or Raymond de Roncas), and other members of his household; Agnes Francou (once Raymond's wet-nurse, and widow of a Stephen Francou), Huguette de la Côte, and her husband Jean of Vienne (or 'Fustier'), a carpenter. Fournier called them, *heresis valdesie seu pauperum de Lugdano* ('The heresy of the Waldensians, or the 'Poor of Lyon''). They called themselves 'the Poor of Christ'.<sup>36</sup>

Raymond was one of the most significant people interrogated by Fournier, and his group is mentioned in other depositions in the register. Raymond himself was a Waldensian deacon. He had been admitted into the sect, he revealed to Fournier, by the *majoralis* John of Lorraine. Raymond refused to profess belief in the doctrine of Purgatory. He openly stated that if what the Church

<sup>36</sup> Duvernoy, *Le registre de l'inquisition de Jacques Fournier*, I, pp. 55-122 (Raymond), pp. 123-7 (Agnes), pp. 128-39 (John) and pp. 140-50 (Huguette), with Fournier's name for the group at I, p.123. See also Duvernoy's *Inquisition à Pamiers. Cathares, juifs lépreaux... devent leur juges* (Toulouse 1966, 1966), pp. 20-32. The women's depositions are translated into English by Shulamith Shahar in an appendix: *Women in a Medieval Heretical Sect: Agnes and Huguette the Waldensians* (Woodbridge, 2001), pp. 131-56 (Agnes at pp. 131-8, Huguette at pp. 138-156). On this cell see also Cameron, *Waldenses*, pp. 87-95 and Lambert, *Medieval Heresy*, pp. 158-61. My PhD student Jack Baigent is researching this group.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Duvernoy, J. (ed. and trans.), *Le registre de l'inquisition de Jacques Fournier, évêque de Pamiers (1318-1325),* ed. J. Duvernoy, 3 vols. (Toulouse, 1965); Le Roy Ladurie, E., *Montaillou village Occitan de 1294 à 1324* (Paris, 1975).

taught or did went contrary to the Gospels, it was sinful. Key examples were judicial killing, and the persecution of those who refused to take oaths. Raymond also outlined their practice with regard to confessing sins to each other, the means by which they elected deacons such as himself as well as their other ministers, and how a layperson could be admitted to the sect. Whilst disobedient, Raymond was not a Donatist, and his group routinely received the Eucharist from Catholic priests.

Huguette was the most involved of the two women in the sect. She was part of a wider network on the eastern Languedoc, having contacts at Montpellier, Arles, Belcaire, and Saint-Gilles-du-Gard, places where Catharism had been far less successful. She had first met Waldensians through a man called Gerard of Arles, and had met Jean of Lorraine at Saint-Gilles. Like other Waldensians, she had attended church, but her religious education came from the Waldensians who she knew. She learnt from them that it was a sin to lie; that Purgatory did not exist, and so prayers and services for the dead were therefore worthless; that it was wrong to harm another person, and this extended to judicial execution by inquisitors; that excommunication meant nothing, and likewise indulgences; and that those of the sect should hear confession and impose their own penances.

Although Raymond of Sainte-Foy pronounced the *Credo*, he was burned by a weeping James Fournier in May 1320, along with Agnes. Huguette and John were executed in August 1321. Duvernoy observes the resulting outcry. It was noted by some that Raymond had joined his hands in prayer in the flames. Some said that he was a martyr. Berenger Escoulan of Foix recounted how, shortly afterwards, everyone was discussing the execution and how bravely Raymond had died. This was evidence for Berenger that Raymond's soul was saved and that he could not have been a heretic. In his turn, Berengar was reported to inquisitors as stating that it was a mortal sin to swear, either in a lie or in telling the truth, and saying that there were only three legitimate ranks of clergy; deacon, priest and bishop, which could be conferred simply by the imposition of hands and the sincere recitation of the Our Father. Dissent was reported elsewhere too, for example at Ornolac. The deposition of its *bailli* William Autatz includes the information that he had been asked why Raymond had been killed, and replied that it was because he denied the power of the pope in absolving sins, and because he did not believe in purgatory.<sup>37</sup>

Bernard Gui

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Duvernoy, 'Les Vaudois', pp. 29-31.

If Jacques Fournier's is the best known register, the best known inquisitor is Bernard Gui, already bishop of Lodève, who was appointed in 1307 and was based at Toulouse. Raymond of Sainte-Foy's testimony formed a basis of the portion of his inquisitors' manual, the *Conduct of Inquiry Concerning Heretical Depravity*. In spite of discussing Waldensians amongst the major heresies of his day, accusing the sect in general of Donatism, Gui says almost little *specific* to southern France. Cameron has demonstrated that such assertions are taken from existing descriptions of the sect rather than from his own trial records. Gui seems to assume that Waldensians constituted a single, homogenous sect, and that 'if his victims did not overtly express a Donatist attitude towards sinful priests, or reject the cult of saints, they must have been concealing something'.<sup>38</sup>

Bernard Gui passed nine hundred and thirty sentences against heretics at Toulouse between 1308 and 1323, including against Waldensians.<sup>39</sup> Because of this, we learn about a remarkable group in the archdiocese of Auch (Gascony). They were migrants from Burgundy, Bresse and Franch-Comté.<sup>40</sup> Specifically, many appear to have settled in or near the town of Mazères, near Castelnau-Barbarens in the county of Astarac, and also in the county of Lomagne. Bérard d'Alièze, noted above, had believed them to be good people and to be saved, and had done so for five or six years. Another witness, Perrin Faure, gave up the names of several Waldensians; the priest Perrin of Gadoux, Jean Moran and Christian Maynes, whom he had believed to be 'good men'. This was probably the same Christian whom Adhémar Bojon notes hid, not wanting to be discovered or shown to anyone.<sup>41</sup> Raymond of Sainte-Foy and his household had retained contact with Burgundian Waldensians in

<sup>39</sup> The edition is *Livre des sentences de l'inquisitor Bernard Gui, 1308-28*, ed. and trans. A. Pales-Gobillard, 2 vols. (Paris, 2002). See also Biller, P., 'Through a glass darkly: Seeing medieval heresy' in *The Medieval World*, ed. P. Linehan and J.L. Nelson (London/New York, 2001), pp. 308-26, at p. 310.

<sup>40</sup> For example in *Le Livre des sentences*, pp. 984-91, 1018-27, 1040-43, 1047-87; Duvernoy, 'Les Vaudois', p. 28 and his 'Albigeois et vaudois en Rouergue', pp. 102-4.

<sup>41</sup> *Le Livre des sentences*, II, pp. 984-7, 988-9, 1040-43.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Bernard Gui, *Practica inquisitionis heretice pravitatis*, ed. C. Douais (Paris, 1886). The edition of the manual most often cited is G. Mollat (ed. and trans.), *Manuel de l'inquisiteur*, 2 vols. (Paris, 1964). On Waldensians, see I, pp. xvii, 34-83 and esp. II, pp. 148-53. Gui's major sources were Stephen of Bourbon and Pseudo-David of Augsburg. See Sackville, *Heresy and Heretics*, pp. 69, 141; Cameron, *Waldenses*, pp. 25-6, 28, 59, 86, 93 (quotation), 93-4.

Gascony, where some of them had also resided, probably in a house of Waldensians such as that at Beaumont de Lomagne.<sup>42</sup>

### The 'Book of Toulouse'

Information about the Gascons can be also found in *The Book of Sentences of the Inquisitors of Toulouse*. This is a lesser-known register which consists of sixteen sermons naming and condemning heretics, by Gui and others. Simonutti says that it 'provided the documentary basis' of Gui's manual. It too recalls a trial in 1310 of Burgundian Gascons. We learn that they were refugees from inquests in the later years of the thirteenth century, and that some of them had arrived via the Rouergue. The group were Lyonists. One, John Philibert, had originally been a priest in Burgundy, who had gone over to the sect when sent to investigate what had become of the émigrés.<sup>43</sup>

Peter Biller uses a deposition of one of the Gascon sect, a woman called Joana, as an example of how we can read inquisitors' interest in matters such as Waldensian belief and practice, such as 'not to say evil, nor to lie or swear' and to copy their 'mode of praying'. The record also casts light on shadier figures such as John of Cerno, who taught Joana and had her confess to him and receive penance. This took the form of fasting on certain Thursdays, and repeating the Our Father. Joana had accepted this penance even though, like Bérard d'Alièze, she had 'thought or knew that the said Waldensian was not a priest ordained by a bishop of the Roman Church'. We also learn from the Book of Toulouse that these heretics called themselves 'Brethren'. Their spiritual leaders were celibate, travelling preachers, such as Perrin Vaudry of Saint-Gaudens. He may have been Latin educated, for he is referred to as *clericus*. His case highlights issues of literacy within heretical sects. Though literate and authoritative, their necessarily peripatetic leaders were not always physically

<sup>42</sup> Pales-Gobillard, *Le Livre des sentences de l'inquisitor Bernard Gui*, II, pp. 984-5; Shahar, *Women in a Medieval Heretical Sect*, deposition of Agnes Francou, p. 132; Brenon, 'Le choix heretique', p. 126.

<sup>43</sup> The original manuscript was once in the possession of John Locke. The first edition, forming part of a larger work, is P. van Limborch (ed.), *Historia Inquisitionis: cui subjungitur Liber sententiarum inquisitionis Tholosanae, ab anno Christi mcccvii ab annum mcccxxiii* (Amsterdam, 1692), 356. The English edition is *The History of the Inquisition* (London, 1816). On Limborch's work in a Protestant and intellectual context, see Simonutti, L., 'Limborch's *Historia inquisitonis* and the pursuit of toleration', *Judeo-Christian Intellectual Culture in the Seventeenth Century*, 163 (1999), pp. 240, 337-55. See also Cameron, *Waldenses*, pp. 78-87, 82-3, 93-4. there for their flock. Instead, religious solidarities within the Gascon group was reinforced by the memorising of texts. The function of committing texts to memory may not have been solely so that illiterate people became involved in oral-textual discourses. Lambert observes something more immediate and fundamental to this precarious religiosity: it reduced the number of books that the sect had in circulation, and therefore would have to hide.<sup>44</sup>

## **Literary sources**

Finally, inquisition resulted in an entirely different genre of sources, *chansons* composed by troubadours in the decades after William of Tudela and his continuator wrote. Unlike the composers of the *Song of the Albigensian Crusade*, however, Catherine Léglu suggests that one troubadour, Peire Cardenal, may perhaps have been drawn to the Waldensian sect. In his song *Ab votz d'angel*, he notes that the Dominicans, whom he regards as corrupt, would use the sect against anyone challenging the process of inquisition: '...they have set up a court to judge cases, and whoever turns them away from that goal is said to be a Waldensian'.<sup>45</sup>

Conversely, a Domincan propaganda poem in Occitan called *The Tale of the Heretic* notes that 'there would never have been a *credens*, a heretic or a Waldensian if a good pastor had been there to contradict them'. At the end of the Tale, Sicart the heretic is won over by the arguments of a man called Izarn and a real-life inquisitor, Brother Ferrer. He accepts that their Authority is legitimate and deriving from the papacy, saying,

"Thanks to your words, I wish to be baptised and returned to the faith that you have preached to be about, you and brother Ferrer, to whom the power is given to bind and unbind, whatever the sin might be of the heretic, the Waldensian, or the clog-wearer".<sup>46</sup>

As such, we see that there is no fixed response to the heretics in troubadour circles, which surely reflect wider social and religious ambivalence towards the sect.

## 3. The Historiography of Southern French Waldensianism.

<sup>44</sup> Biller, P., 'Through a glass darkly', pp. 310, 313, 315;Cameron, Waldenses, pp. 81-2; Lambert, Medieval Heresy, p. 163.

<sup>45</sup> Léglu, Rist and Taylor, *The Cathars*, pp. 79, 114 (quotation).

<sup>46</sup> Léglu, Rist and Taylor, *The Cathars*, pp. 211, 213.

The earliest modern study of southern French Waldensianism specifically is probably that of M. Roschach in 1868, based on Raymond of Sainte-Foy's network.<sup>47</sup> It highlights the group's regional and international links. Scholarly editions of sources, with excellent introductions and painstaking work on the identification and contextualisation of texts, was undertaken by Antoine Dondaine, Christine Thouzellier and Jean Duvernoy between the 1940s and 1960s.<sup>48</sup> Their editions still dominate bibliographies. However, as a generalisation, the historiography of heresy in Languedoc privileges Catharism. Many works only discuss Waldensianism because it was in the same sourcebase as regional evidence for Catharism.<sup>49</sup> Even that focussing on Waldensians specifically, including much of the above, has been undertaken by scholars who have Catharism as their primary interest, and is comparative rather than specific.

Waldensians were considered significant enough to form the basis of the second ever volume of the specialist journal *Cahiers de Fanjeaux*, in 1967.<sup>50</sup> However, much of this work concerns the development of the medieval sect more widely, or is concerned primarily with the Poor Catholics. With the exception of Duvernoy's work on Quercy and the Rouergue, some opportunities to fully exploit the Occitan sources were missed by French scholars. I refer here to the treasure trove that is inquisition depositions. See, however, M.-H. Vicaire's important chapter on the debate between Catholics and Waldensians in 1207 at Pamiers,<sup>51</sup> whilst Yves Dossat was perhaps amongst the first to

<sup>48</sup> Cited above, and see also Duvernoy's 'L'Unité du valdéisme en France à la fin du xiiie siècle (Bourgogne, Sillon rhodanien, gascogne)', in his *Dissidents du pays d'Oc: Cathares, Vaudois et Béguins* (Toulouse, 1994), pp. 141-53.

<sup>49</sup> For example, see his 'Albigeois et vaudois en Quercy', *Dissidents du pays d'Oc*, pp. 85-97, at 91-2; and 'Albigeois et vaudois en Rouergue', in *ibid*. pp. 99-110, at 102-4. See also Thouzellier's *Hérésie et hérétiques* (Rome, 1969), esp. pp. 39-80.

<sup>50</sup> See above and Selge, K. V., 'L'aile droite du movement vaudois et naissance des Pauvres catholiques et des Pauvres réconciliés', *CF* 2, pp. 227-43 and Vicaire, M.-H., 'Les Vaudois et Pauvres catholiques contre les Cathares (1190-1223), *CF* 2, pp. 244-72.

<sup>51</sup> 'Rencontre à Pamiers des courantes des vaudois et dominicain (1207)', CF 2, pp. 163-94.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Roschach, M., 'Une émigration bourguignonne dans le sud-ouest de la France, au xiiie et au xive siècle', *Mémoires de l'Académie imperial des sciences, inscriptions et belles-lettres de Toulouse,* series 6, number 6 (Toulouse, 1868), 97-121.

attempt to deal systematically with the early inquisitorial sources.<sup>52</sup> Jean Duvernoy gave the sect consideration also in introductions to his several editions of volumes primarily relating to Catharism.<sup>53</sup> Anne Brenon's recent survey of medieval heresy includes a brief chapter on Waldensians in Languedoc specifically.<sup>54</sup>

As a generalisation, it would be fair to say that the francophone work rarely takes an integrated approach to Waldensians in southern France. It is as though the current ran parallel to Catharism, touching only at points of contestation, such as in debates. In many ways this is inevitable, because even localised studies of Catharism which are interested in the social and everyday life of heresy have few sources for Waldensians to work with, especially in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries.

Anglophone work on Waldensians is significant. It began with the Protestant theologian Philip van Limborch. The sect has been considered from a wider range of perspectives since the later twentieth century, including in work on heresy more widely, such as that of Wakefield<sup>55</sup> and Lambert.<sup>56</sup> Rouse and Rouse's important work on Ms. Marston 266 in the Yale University Beinecke library is essentially about Durand of Huesca and not Waldensians, in spite of its title.<sup>57</sup> Adam L. Hoose is doing important work on Durand of Huesca and his identification of Cathars as dualists in the 1180s and 90s.<sup>58</sup> In terms of specialist studies on the Waldensian movement Europe-wide, which deal with southern

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> 'Les vaudois méridionaux d'après les documents de l'inquisition', CF 2, pp. 208-227.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> For example, *Le registre de l'inquisition de Jacques Fournier*, I, pp. 14-16 and *Chronique de Guillaume Pelhisson* (Paris, 1994).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Brenon, A., 'Vaudoisie en Languedoc' (above).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Wakefield, W., *Heresy, Crusade and Inquisition in Southern France, 1100-1250* (London, 1974), esp. pp. 43-7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Lambert, M. D., *The Cathars* (Oxford, 1998), now in its third edition: Lambert, *Medieval Heresy* (above).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Rouse and Rouse, 'The schools and the Waldensians'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Duran of Huesca (c. 1160-1230): A Waldensian seeking a remedy to heresy', *Journal of Medieval History*, 38:2 (2014), 173-89.

France in a broader context, that of Euan Cameron stands out.<sup>59</sup> Audisio's work contains little specific to southern France.<sup>60</sup> However, on the south specifically, Peter Biller has done most, not least on Waldensian women.<sup>61</sup> Shulamith Shadar's recent work on Waldensian woman in Raymond of Sainte-Foy's group is another regional study addressing women in the sect.<sup>62</sup> Caterina Bruschi's approach to the inquisitorial sources features Waldensians quite centrally amongst her itinerant subjects.<sup>63</sup>

However, the fortunate historian working on the northern Languedoc can attempt to paint a picture of communities in which Cathars, Waldensians, their supporters, and people who had nothing to do with either, encountered each other on a daily basis as they went about the activities which they later described to the inquisitors.<sup>64</sup>

<sup>59</sup> *The Waldenses: Rejections of Holy Church in Medieval Europe* (Oxford, 2000), esp. pp. 23-35, 70-95.

<sup>60</sup> *The Waldensian Dissent: Persecution and Survival c.1170-c.1570*, trans. C. Davison (Cambridge, 1999).

<sup>61</sup> See his collected articles in *The Waldenses*: ' "*Curate infirmos*": the medieval Waldensian practice of medicine', *Waldenses*, pp. 49-67; 'Medieval Waldensian abhorrence of killing pre c.1400', *Waldenses*, pp. 81-93; 'The *Liber Electorum*', *Waldenses*, pp. 191-206; 'Medieval Waldensians' construction of the past', *Waldenses*, pp. 191-206; 'The Preaching of the Waldensian sisters', *Waldenses*, pp. 125-58, esp. 126-8; '*Thesaurus Absconditus*: The hidden treasure of the Waldensians', *Waldenses*, pp. 97-110. Biller has also produced overviews of the historiography: 'The Waldenses in the Fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. The current state of knowledge', in *Waldenses*, pp. 7-8, 21 for southern France; and 'Goodbye to Waldensianism?', *Past and Present* 192 (2006), 3-33. Most recently, see his brief but significant chapter, 'Interrogations of Waldensians' (above).

<sup>62</sup> Cited above.

<sup>63</sup> Bruschi, C., *The Wandering Heretics of Languedoc* (Cambridge, 2009).

<sup>64</sup> See Feuchter, J., Die städtischen Eliten von Montauban vor dem Inquisitor Petrus Cellani (1236/1241) (Tübingen, 2007); Taylor, Heresy, Crusade and Inquisition (above) and, 'Sunt quadraginta anni vel circa': Southern French Waldensians and the Albigensian Crusade. French History, 32: 3 (2018), 327-349.

#### 4. The name 'Waldensian'

An important element in recent work on heresy more widely is the consideration of the use of the names given to different sects in both the medieval and modern period, and what these names imply. This is the case also with Waldensians. The majority of medieval sources above, almost all of them in Latin, use the term *Valdenses*. But this is not as straightforward as it seems. In the early historiography, Alan of Lille says, 'They are called Waldenses after their heresiarch', intended to indicate that they followed a man, not Christ.<sup>65</sup> Bernard of Foucaude interprets the name as meaning 'dense vale', in that they were 'enveloped in a deep, dense darkness of error'.<sup>66</sup> As such, the accepted name was not regarded neutrally. The southerners were explicitly associated with the Lyonist wing of the wider movement in the nomenclature. Ermengaud of Béziers calls them variously 'the Lyonists' and 'the Waldenses', observes that there were others called 'the Poor' because, 'they take no thought for the morrow', and 'the Sandal-shod', because they wear perforated footwear'.<sup>67</sup> As late as the 1270s, they were apparently known to William of Puylaurens as both 'Waldensians' and 'Poor Men of Lyon'.<sup>68</sup> Possibly these well-informed authors were making a specific point about the southern French branch having taken a more moderate path than the Poor of Lombardy. Ermengaud of Béziers also notes that some 'heretics' believed that there was 'a good God and a malign god' and that there were 'other heretics...Waldenses'.<sup>69</sup> So Waldensians could be a conceptual sub-set of 'heretics'. Inquisitorial records, on the other hand, almost always refer to the sect as Waldensians as opposed to 'heretics'. The two terms are used so that they can be identified as different from Cathars. For example,

'William of Broile saw Waldensians and listened to their preaching. *Item*, he saw heretics in another place and assisted in discussion about the [New] Testament in the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Wakefield and Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, p. 217; Audisio, *Preachers by Night*, pp. 8-9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Wakefield and Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, p. 211.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Wakefield and Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, p. 234.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Sibly and Sibly, *The Chronicle of William of Puylaurens*, p. 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Wakefield and Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, p. 231.

presence of Waldensians. He saw heretics and listened to their preaching and discussed creation with them...'. $^{70}$ 

Cameron observes that the 'continual dialogue between literary tradition and direct testimony' in the manuals resulted from inquisitors' application of established examples to trials they were themselves involved in.<sup>71</sup> William Pelhisson, for example, refers to 'Cathars' as *heretici perfecti* and Waldensians as *Valdenses*, using terminology denoting a distinct status within the set of 'heretics' for the Cathar elect, and 'Waldensian' outside of both.<sup>72</sup> In other words, distinguishing between the two groups of heretics was found to be necessary on a legal as well as conceptual basis.

However, we must remember that when inquisitors give 'Valdenses' this is a Latin translation of local terminology. To the southern French, thinking, reading, discussing and working in the vernacular – that is to say, the vast majority of people who had contact with Waldensians - the sectarians were more usually called *sabatatz* (or *ensabatatz*), 'clog-wearers'. Occasionally this is reflected in the depostions. Peter Desplas was a 'sandal wearer', to Peter Garcias.<sup>73</sup> In the Dominican *apologia* 'The Tale of the Heretic', they are first 'Waldensians' (we read, 'There never would have been a *credens*, a heretic or a Waldensian if a good pastor had been there to contradict him') but later 'Waldensian' is distinguished from 'clog wearer'.<sup>74</sup> William of Tudela and his continuator used both types of term, Latin and local.<sup>75</sup> In addition, they were often described as being *boni homines* (good men) in inquisitorial sources, of which variants of *bos omes* would have been the vernacular.<sup>76</sup> Cathars were

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Duvernoy, *L'inquisition en Quercy*, p. 183.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Cameron, *Waldenses*, p. 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Guillaume Pelhisson, *Chronique*, pp. 42-3, 56-7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Léglu, Rist and Taylor, *The Cathars*, pp. 167, and 169 note 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Léglu *et al., The Cathars,* pp. 208-13, at 211, 213.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> *The Song of the Cathar Wars*, pp. 14, 41, 136, cf. p. 79.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> For example, Duvernoy, *L'inquisition en Quercy*, pp. 68-9, 88-9.

often referred to like this as well. In fact, we should regard it as a conventional regional epithet regarding worthy status, rather than as a name for specific heretics.<sup>77</sup>

However, the existence of very localised terminology does not mean that the movement was essentially of the region. This is an important point. Historians have noted the significance of Burgundian migrants at the end of our period, and logically the first of the sect in the region must have been migrants of the same region. In the intervening period, we have evidence that communication between Waldensians of southern France and those elsewhere was frequent. I shall also suggest that a significant number of those noted in the registers of the 1240s may not have been local to the diocese of Cahors. Furthermore, we know that Waldensians in southern France referred to themselves as 'sisters' and 'brothers' by c. 1300 at the latest, just as those of other regions did. As such, we should in not regard those of southern France to have been geographically or ideologically isolated. So, whilst those in southern France may have had some of their own their own customs and practices that were established over many generations, they were part of wider networks. I agree with Biller, for this region at least, that we cannot go as far of Merlo and speak of 'Waldensianisms'.<sup>78</sup>

# 5. The demography of Waldensianism in Southern France

### Location

Waldensianism appears to have been widespread in southern France but, like Catharism, had petered out by c.1320. However, Lambert notes that they were not as well established in the heartlands of Catharism - the Lauragais and Toulousain - but instead regions including Quercy and the Rouergue where Catharism had a less uniform base of support.<sup>79</sup> Again unlike Catharism, we do not have evidence for long-standing communities spanning many generations in a locations. The sectarians seem to have been frequently migrant and marginal most of the time, certainly after the defections of 1207. The anonymous account which was probably composed by Ermengaud of Béziers has them operating 'to the sea at Narbonne and thence to the sea at Bordeaux',<sup>80</sup> that is to say,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Léglu, Rist and Taylor, *The Cathars*, p. 79.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Biller, P., 'Goodbye to Waldensianism?', *Past and Present* 192 (2006), 3-33.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Lambert, *Medieval Heresy*, p. 164.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Wakefield and Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, p. 234; Cameron, *Waldenses*, p. 71.

across the regions of the Languedoc and Gascony, from the Mediterranean to the Atlantic. This was undoubtedly a generalisation, and concrete evidence of Waldensian activity is far more geographically restricted.

At Narbonne in c.1190, they were confounded and lost important members, so in all probability fragmented as a group. On firmer ground in Foix, where Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay tells us that they were under the protection of the comital family, we should consider them to have been settled by the debate of 1207, and therefore thriving in an area in which Catharism was also firmly implanted. We hear little of the heretics in crusader sources, except that in 1214, when the town of Morlhon in the Rouergue was besieged, seven Waldensians discovered and 'confessed their unbelief freely and fully' and were burnt 'with great rejoicing'.<sup>81</sup> In 1273, Waldensians were discovered by inquisitors in the Rouergue, five of whom were from Burgundy.<sup>82</sup> We can therefore suggest that the Waldensian presence in the Rouergue, illuminated again in the early fourteenth century, was important and whilst the sources do not exist for us to observe unbroken settlement, it was certainly frequently replenished by the migration of others of the Lyonist persuasion. However, by the time that Raymond of Sainte-Foy's group was arrested, we have little evidence for Waldensians other than his tiny group at Pamiers, and in the Rouergue and Gascony.

In terms of the Cathar heartlands of the Toulousain and Lauragais, the regions which formed the heart of the warzone, we have much less evidence. In 1205, Pope Innocent III suspended the bishop of Béziers for not acting as he should have against Cathars and Waldensians in his diocese, in spite of promising in 1194 to do so and to compel local nobles to do likewise.<sup>83</sup> Such lords included rulers of towns like Lavaur, in the Albigeoise William of Tudela associates Waldensians with the town's co-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay, *History*, p. 231. Duvernoy refers to them as Waldensianism's first martyrs: *Le register de Jacques Fournier*, I, p. 16. It was once erroneously thought that Durand of Huesca himself was from the Rouergue. However, others Poor Catholics appear more certainly to have been from Najac and Saint-Antonin. See Lambert, *Medieval Heresy*, p. 83 note 40, *cf*. Cameron, *Waldenses*, p. 53, and Audisio, *Waldensian Dissent*, p. 36; Taylor, *Heresy Crusade and Inquisition*, p. 11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> Duvernoy, *Le register de Jacques Fournier*, I, p. 16; Brenon, 'Le choix heretique', p. 126; Duvernoy, 'Albigeois et vaudois en Rouergue', p. 102.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Léglu, Rist and Taylor, *The Cathars*, p. 8.

ruler Aimery, lord also of Montréal, and Laurac, both near Carcassonne.<sup>84</sup>By the 1240s Waldensians were marginal in recent memory, it would appear that there had once been communities Auriac, Castelnaudary, Castres, Saix, Viviers-les-Magnes.<sup>85</sup>

The dearth of other evidence for Waldensians in the central Languedoc by the 1240s is best understood in terms of the migration patterns we can observe in Quercy. As we have seen, Peter Seilan found hundreds of witnesses who had associated with Waldensians in the diocese of Cahors. On the one hand, it seems sensible to consider that there may have been a similar Waldensian saturation in the Toulousain, masked from us because of the patchy survival of the records. The towns of Montauban and Castelsarrasin were well within the cultural sphere of Toulouse as it was, and it seems unlikely that they would have been any less confessionally complex neighbours.

However, a mass migration of religious dissidents would take place, out of the Toulousain and into central and upper Quercy. The settlement of 1229 had brought French officials into the Toulousain, placing all heretics in greater danger than ever, as a widespread social and political revolution-fromwithout took place. The resulting hostility to the crusade on the part of Catholic lords from central and northern Quercy, enabled heretical refugees to flood into northern Quercy for the first time.<sup>86</sup> Certainly many Cathars remained in the Toulousain, but perhaps this was not the case with Waldensians. Either way, the heretical communities north of the Garonne-Tran-Aveyron confluence were only a few years old when Peter Seilan turned his attention to them. The depositions would support relatively recent social relationships. Bernarda Faure of Beaucaire had rented a house to Waldensians for a year; Na Algars du Villar of Montcuq did so for female Waldensians for two years.<sup>87</sup> This sort of arrangement was the norm, whereas the community in southern Quercy was certainly better embedded, most notably at Montauban, where they had their own houses and wellestablished relationships with leading families. The patriarch of the Carbonnel family, Peter senior, admitted to serving food, including meat and wine, to Waldensians 'fifty times', and Lady Carbonnel

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> *The Song of the Cathar Wars*, p. 41.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> Depositions indicating this are translated in Biller, 'Interrogations of Waldensians', pp. 232-3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> A central thesis of Taylor, *Heresy, Crusade and Inquisition*, esp. pp. 209-34

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> Duvernoy, *L'inquisition en Quercy*, pp. 100-1, 122-3.

had seen many Waldensians and given them food in her youth.<sup>88</sup> The town of Castelsarrasin was the comital administrative centre for Quercy. Bernard of Caux's register reveals some Waldensian activity there. That of Pérégrine Gasc has been noted. The young knight Arnold of Corbarieu had observed three men whom he discovered later to have been Waldensians, on a hill called *Malrazen*, and had also seen one of the few other Waldensians to be named, Toulza de Lavaur, labouring on the walls of the church of Saint-Nauphary.<sup>89</sup>

## Social status

In Europe more widely, it was in manufacturing and commercial towns that Waldensians most often established themselves, according to Herbert Grundmann. Their natural support came from relatively successful urban families, and eventually people from humbler backgrounds became involved.<sup>90</sup> This holds for southern France to an extent. Toulouse, Montauban and Castelsarrasin fit this model. However, we have seen that Waldensians also had a significant presence in the mountains of the Pyrenees. Like the *castra* of northern and central Quercy, and also the Lauragais, these were fortified towns dominated by local lords. Furthermore, we do not have enough evidence to make generalisations about the social rank of Waldensians themselves.<sup>91</sup> From the sheer scale of their success in Quercy, many supporters must have been from relatively humble backgrounds. If it is indeed the case that the records reveal large-scale periodical migration, many may not have had their social or economic origins in the region or have firm roots in the places where they were encountered. The lack of evidence would indeed reflect the itinerant, precarious lifestyle which they actively sought.

# Individuals and families

The evidence of the depositions indicates that many witnesses had taken their religious choices very seriously. There was a three-way vying for souls and many deponents were in a transitional stage

<sup>91</sup> Cameron, *Waldenses*, pp. 58-9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> For the Carbonnel, see Duvernoy, *L'inquisition en Quercy*, pp. 132-3, 148-9, 166-7, 170-1, 192-3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Doat 22, fol. 71r-v.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> Grundmann, H., *Religious Movements in the Middle Ages*, trans. S. Rowan (Notre Dame, 1995), pp.
71-3.

between beliefs, making choices according to what they encountered. For example, William of Broile had assisted in discussions of the New Testament in the presence of Waldensians, and had discussed the nature of creation with Cathars. Peter Raymond Roque had listened to Waldensian and Cathar sermons, and believed both sets to be good people. Bernard Raimond of Montauban sought out both sects to find out more about them. He found the Waldensians to be good men, but he found the Cathars to be better.<sup>92</sup>

Fascinatingly, in locations where we can identify both Cathars and Waldensians, there is little to suggest that by the mid-thirteenth century that support for one sect over another ran in specific families. It can also be shown that the vast majority of families represented in the data for Montauban and Gourdon (by far the two largest data sets) had members involved with both sects.<sup>93</sup> The lords of Foix contained supporters of both. The same pattern is common in Quercy, where we can even quantify it. Adherence to Catharism *alone* appears to have been the case for only five families at Montauban (14.7%), and only seven in the case of Waldensians (20.6%), whilst twenty two (64.7%) had members admitting to association with both.<sup>94</sup> At Gourdon, only two families (8.3%) were represented by members who all attached themselves to the sect, whereas fourteen (58.3%) associated with both kinds. By the end of our period, however, families do seem to have played an important role in discreet recruitment to the sect.<sup>95</sup>

However, *individuals* tended to associate with either Cathars or Waldensians. Of around two hundred and forty-six people investigated at Montauban, fifty-three percent admitted to contact with Waldensians alone, and only fourteen to involvement with both sects. At Gourdon, of around one hundred and thirty-one people, twenty-three percent associated only with Waldensians, and sixteen percent with both. In the latter record, of the nine members of the Goulême family, Gaillarde, Alice, Wilma, Raimonde and Peter consulted and patronised Waldensians, including the doctor Peter of Vals. Only Guiraude and Lady Péronne were Cathar adherents. In the case of the Bonald family, Bernard had met both Pierre de Vals and the *perfectus* Touzet de Noguès, but of the two sects preferred the Waldensians, personally recommending them even though his kinsman

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Duvernoy, L'inquisition en Quercy, pp. 82-3, 128-9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Taylor, Heresy, Crusade and Inquisition, pp. 160-65.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Taylor, *Heresy, Crusade and Inquisition*, pp. 163-4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> Cameron, *Waldenses*, pp. 86-7.

William was a particularly active Cathar supporter. Raymond Gastaud of Montauban is untypical in Quercy in having engaged in specific ritual practice with both sects: he celebrated the commemoration of the Last Supper with Waldensians, but greeted and adored *perfecti* and asked of them, *"Benedicte"* ("Bless me").<sup>96</sup>

Sparks has written most recently about the relationship between heresy and families. One example illustrates well the partisanship of individuals within a family which might have contact with both sects. In Bernard Gui's register, a man called Gerald spoke of having been taken discretely to one side by a man who, before preaching to him that it was wrong to take oaths or lie, first ascertained the that he was the son of a trusted man called Formond. Gerald rejected what he heard, which from context we can probably safely identify as Waldensianism. But when he recounted the story to Formond, the father commended the sect to his son.<sup>97</sup>

## 6. Waldensian women

The data above unsettles the long-standing concept of the 'Cathar family',<sup>98</sup> and rules out 'Waldensian families'. Women came into the sect through the influence of many people, not necessarily family members. On the face of it, both sects offered more to women than the Catholic Church did. Waldensian sisters could be considered for itinerant preaching and, where they were found to have the right disposition, they indeed undertook this, many of them giving up wealth, marriages and status to do so.<sup>99</sup> However, we have to be careful about how to interpret the evidence. Is it the case that women could attain a significantly higher status, formally or informally,

<sup>98</sup> *Cf.* Brenon, A., 'Catharism in the family in Languedoc in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries: an investigation based on inquisition sources, in eds. K. Reyerson and J. Drendel, *Urban and Rural Communities in Medieval France* (Leiden, 1998), pp. 291-304, esp. 296, 301.

<sup>99</sup> Cameron, *Waldenses*, pp. 31-2; Lambert, *Medieval Heresy*, p. 80.Biller, 'Interrogating Waldensians,' p. 235; Brenon, 'Catharism in the family', pp. 296, 301.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Duvernoy, *Inquisition*, pp. 180-1. On the nature and implications of the data, see Taylor, *Heresy Crusade and Inquisition*, pp. 154-65, 231.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Bernard Gui, *Sentences*, I, pp. 1578-80; Sparkes, C., *Heresy, Inquisition and Life Cycle in Medieval Languedoc* (Woodbridge, 2014), p. 75.

within the sect than they could in the Roman Church? More specifically, if their relative equality was real within the early movement, was it undermined towards 1300?

Two examples shed light on the first question. Alan of Lille's tirade against Waldensian preaching includes Pauline texts used by other polemicists against women, asserting that they should be silent in churches even when they had questions, and must ask these of their husbands at home instead. They should learn in silence, and never be allowed to teach a man. They were in any case 'silly' and could not learn. He also observes that male Waldensians were likely to 'creep into the houses of widows and lead them astray'.<sup>100</sup> Of course we should we wary of listening to the heavily abstracted obsessions of misogynistic polemicists against heretical movements. But Alan was accurate: Waldensian women not only asked questions and learned, but also preached and taught. Biller observes not only that they *did* preach, but that Waldensians believed that women *ought* to preach, and finds plenty of evidence for it whether or not their profile was as high as that of men.<sup>101</sup> In a rare record from the crusade era, we learn that they lived and preached to other women at Castelnaudary and at Lacroisille, near Puylaurens,<sup>102</sup> and female preachers Raymunda of Balinis and Alice Calosa were apprehended in the diocese of Narbonne.<sup>103</sup>

The debate at Pamiers in 1207 also sheds light on the question of the experience of women within the early sect, as well as how clerical attitudes such as Alan's might have manifested themselves in practice. In telling us about the debate, Peter of Les-Vaux-de-Cernay mentions that Count Raymond-Roger of Foix had two heretical sisters, one involved with Cathars and the other with Waldensians.<sup>104</sup> William of Puylaurens tells us that a sister of the count was 'openly protecting heretics' and attempted to engage in the disputation, but was told by a Dominican, "Go, lady, and work at your

<sup>102</sup> Doat 24, f. 133 r-v; Brenon, 'Vaudoisie en Languedoc', pp. 124-5.

<sup>103</sup> Cameron, Waldenses, p. 74

<sup>104</sup> Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay, *History*, pp. 27-8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> I Cor. 14: 34-35; I Tim. 2: 11-12; II Tim. 3: 1-7; Wakefield and Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, p. 220.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Biller, 'Through a glass darkly', p. 322 and 'The Preaching of the Waldensian sisters', p. 139, and see pp. 140-2.

distaff. It can be no business of yours to join in a debate such as this".<sup>105</sup> This incident is understandably taken as an example of why women might support heretics before monks. The sister in question is generally assumed to have been Esclarmonde of Foix, and the incident cited as an example of female patronage of Cathars which resulted from clerical misogyny.<sup>106</sup> However, Esclarmonde was a well-attested as a Cathar supporter,<sup>107</sup> and this debate did not involve Cathars but Waldensians. As such, this was more likely the other, unidentified sister, who supported Waldensians. The point is the same: some women in Languedoc had much invested in the heretical life, be it Waldensian or Cathar, and were used to better treatment within the sects than they were outside of them. As such, we have accounts of Waldensians causing rifts in families even before the crusade, for example in that of the witness Peter Simon of Castelnaudary. He had a sister and a mother, Aimengarda, who were Waldensians before the crusade, 'living openly' in the town. He had pleaded with his sister to return to the Catholic faith, but she had refused.<sup>108</sup> Biller notes evidence for dedicated houses for Waldensian women at Castelnaudary, such as that run by Galharda Bruna, operating openly in c. 1206 but concealing its inhabitants from view from 1209.<sup>109</sup> By the middle of our period, we have references in depositions to Waldensian women having enough support and status to live in houses established for them in Quercy, such as ones let to them by Na Algartz at Montcuq and Bernarde Fabrissa at Beaucaire.<sup>110</sup>

Women still preached and taught into the early inquisitorial period. One example is a woman called Geralda, who was sheltered by Petronilla Dejean and by Péronne at Gourdon. Wilma Michela, who testified about the sect at Castelnaudary, named Bernada of Pomas, Rixende of Limoux and a

<sup>105</sup> *The Chronicle of William of Puylaurens,* p. 24.

<sup>106</sup> Duvernoy, J., *Le Catharisme* ii: *L'histoire des cathares* (Toulouse, 1979), p. 48, for the original identification of Esclarmonde.

<sup>107</sup> As was Philippa, countess of Foix and wife of Raymond-Roger, *cf.* Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay, *History*, pp. 27-8, at p. 28.

<sup>108</sup> Biller, 'Interrogations of Waldensians', p. 232.

<sup>109</sup> Biller, 'Interrogation of Waldensians', p. 233, and 'The Preaching of the Waldensian sisters', pp. 135-7.

<sup>110</sup> Biller, 'The preaching of Waldensian sisters', pp. 134-7, 155, 156.

woman called Christiana, and said that they had taught her that 'no one ought to take an oath, for the sake of the truth or a lie, nor to promise, justly or unjustly'. The female preachers Arnalda and 'Bona Domina' were captured at Castras in 1239 and appear in several depositions made in 1245. They had been living in the house of Galharda Bruna for some time and were put into the care of Raymond and Peter Martini of Viviers by Galharda Martini, of Castres. Amongst the evidence of inquisitorial interest in such women, Biller notes their remarkably high profile of women in the anonymous inquisitors' manual written at Carcassonne in the later 1240s.<sup>111</sup>

However, women appear gradually to vanish from the sources from the mid-1240s onward. There need be no other explanation for this than that all Waldensians sought a lower profile. Nonetheless, some historians consider that, whereas there had once been relative gender equality between the brothers and sisters, the sect became more mysogynistic. Shulamith Shahar, identifies a highly gendered sect in c.1300. The sisters were doubly marginalised, she argues, as heretics, but also as women even within the sect. This reflects wider discussions relating to women in the sect, and a good deal of that evidence relates to southern France. The testimony of Raymond of Sainte-Foy in c. 1319 is central to the debate. It would seem to confirm that a change had taken place. According to his deposition, Waldensians by this time were almost all men, with no women being ordained. The men were not merely strictly celibate, but no married men or widowers with children still alive could be admitted. Women, he said, could not even preach and may not even be allowed the kiss the hand of the sect's male leaders, let alone share their rank.<sup>112</sup> Shahar takes this at face value, and this position resonates with those of Marxist such as G. Koch, and with that of G. Gonne, who stressed a generalised conservatism taking hold within the sect more generally. In Biller's words, they concluded that 'Waldensian women's history begins gloriously in the five years before 1180, with a ministry of free itinerant preaching, alongside men, but by the early fourteenth century this activity

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> Duvernoy, *L'inquisition*, pp. 68-9; Léglu, Rist and Taylor, *The Cathars*, p. 140; Dondaine, 'manuel de l'Inquisiteur', pp. 106, 144-5; Toulouse Ms 609, 249r. See Biller, 'The preaching of Waldensian sisters', pp. 134-7, 155, 156; Biller, 'The preaching of Waldensian sisters', pp. 125-58, at 129-31. Biller, 'Interrogations of Waldensians', p. 233; Cameron, *Waldenses*, p. 74.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Duvernoy, *Registre d'inquisition de Jacques Fournier*, I, pp. 72-6, 96-9. See Cameron, *Waldenses*,
p. 88 and Duvernoy, 'Les vaudois', p. 25.

has disappeared...So, the first 140 years of Waldensianism saw the Sisters moving from glory to decline'.<sup>113</sup>

But Biller does not agree with them. He criticises a similar model, that of Ernst Troelsch, which posits that heretical movements in general became more conservative and reactionary over time. By implication, Biller would also reject Lutz Kaelber's recent application of Troelsch to the question of women preachers specifically, which is that once persecution took hold in the 1230s, women 'became largely excluded from this circle'.<sup>114</sup> For Biller, however, it is only in the evidence base that women lose their profile, not within the movement. He shows Raymond to have protected Waldensian women in just the way that he protected the majority of other Waldensians he knew, which was by being tight-lipped and uncooperative concerning living people and his connections with them, and testifying against the dead instead.

Furthermore, Bernard Gui himself encountered Waldensian sisters such as Raymonda of Castres, and Biller finds other evidence for their existence in c.1300. He demonstrates from a variety of sources, that what was occurring was not a decline in female Waldensianism, but a declined in inquisitors' interest in them.<sup>115</sup> Indeed, Raymond of Sainte-Foy, in being explicit that the Brothers and Sisters must never sleep in the same room except where unavoidable,<sup>116</sup> indicates that there *were* still sisters. Indeed, unlike Catharism and Catholic monasticism, but like the first followers of Jesus, Waldensianism was not a sect within which the sexes were segregated at all time. Raymond's own household is evidence of this. But whilst Biller argues that the later evidence effectively conceals the sisters, he concedes that later in the century they were less visible outside of their houses, and been forced to compromise on the question of stability in residence. They even paid rent, and as such may have been using money and have taken on more of a supportive, even

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> Biller, 'The Preaching of the Waldensian sisters', p. 127.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Kaelber, 'Other- and inner-wordly asceticism in medieval Waldensianism: A Weberian Analysis', Sociology of Religion, 56:2 (1995), 91-119, at 104.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Biller, 'Interrogating Waldensians,' p. 235; Biller, 'Through a glass darkly', p. 323, and 'The Preaching of the Waldensian sisters', pp. 128-34, 144.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Duvernoy, 'Les Vaudois', pp. 24-5.

domestic role within the sect, in contrast with the 1240s where they seem, from the evidence of Bernarda of Saix, to have had maids themselves.<sup>117</sup>

There are other perspectives on this question. Merlo is not convinced that women were high-profile within the sect even in its early period. They played no obvious role at the various Church councils where the brethren were present.<sup>118</sup> Cameron takes the evidence to imply an existence for Waldensian sisters which was a supportive one, with limited contact with the brothers and 'beguine-style'.<sup>119</sup> In Quercy, women certainly featured highly in the support offered to Peter of Vals. For example, Petronilla Dejean of Gourdon hosted and fed him for eight days whilst he used her house to preach. But such women were not Waldensians *per se*, but supporters, and as such their religious status was already lower. Indeed, Petronilla cared for a Waldensian woman too.<sup>120</sup> It seems that the last reference to a Sister in southern France was in Bernard Gui's record of 1314,<sup>121</sup> but we should note that the Sisters disappear in the the non-gender specific *Valdenses* in a way that groups of female Cathars - *perfectae* - do not.<sup>122</sup>

# 7. The Waldensian life

# Belief and religiosity

As we have seen, initially, the southern French Waldensians were heretical simply in their insistence on preaching and the rejection of killing and swearing oaths. Their questioning of the doctrine of purgatory, and thereby the point of offerings and prayers for the dead may have followed before inquisition. At some point they indeed began to dispute whether ordination into the priesthood was necessary for the performance of the sacraments. Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay suggests that some had concluded that they could be performed by Waldensians, and this had certainly happened by c.1300. However, we should not conclude that extremism short of Donatism was inevitable. Rather,

<sup>121</sup> Biller, 'Interrogating Waldensians,' p. 235.

<sup>122</sup> Biller, 'The preaching of Waldensian sisters', pp. 129-30, 130.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> Biller, 'Interrogations of Waldensians', pp. 232, 235-6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> As cited in Biller, 'The Preaching of the Waldensian sisters', pp. 127-8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> *Waldenses*, p. 74, 88.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup>Duvernoy, *L'inquisition en Quercy*, pp. 68-9; Léglu, Rist and Taylor, *The Cathars*, p. 140.

it was imported by the ongoing links between the Waldensians and the Brothers and Sisters beyond the region. Radicalisation was surely also born of frustration at the clerical response to their initially moderate stance. Furthermore, some Waldensian beliefs in southern France evolved as the situation did. Crusade and inquisition no doubt played a role in an emerging opposition to killing, even judicial execution and sometimes even of Cathars, and in the adamant re-stressing of the refusal to swear oaths even, again, in a legal context. Thus, at the end of our period, Huguette de la Côte's deposition contains Waldensian belief and practice concerning swearing, Purgatory and intervention on behalf of the dead, excommunication, confession and absolution, and the relative authority of the Pope and of Waldensian leaders, and not least the killing of Cathars.<sup>123</sup>

### On swearing oaths and killing

The refusal to swear never lost its centrality. Raymond of Sainte-Foy claimed to have been taken ill once when swearing an oath, which reinforced his belief that to do so was wrong, and so he refused to do so before the court.<sup>124</sup> It was one of the few characteristics of the faith that Agnes Francou appeared to understand and practice, declaring several times that she would not swear even to save her life. The Gascon brethren taught likewise, but whereas some would swear if required and receive penances for this mortal sin, others would refuse to swear and face the wrath of the inquisitor.<sup>125</sup>

At the other extreme, yet inextricably coupled in depositions with the refusal to swear, was the refusal to accept killing as forgivable in any circumstances. Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay noted this. Biller notes numerous examples, including from MS 609. One is that of Peter Marti of Montespieu, near Castres, who told the inquisitor that he 'heard them preaching – among other things, that one should not kill or swear, even for the sake of justice'. Bernarde Faure of Beaucaire in Quercy was told that it was wrong to kill or swear by Waldensians, and the little network of people who heeded Waldensians at Montcuq had been taught the same. However, at the end of the period, Raymond of Sainte-Foy apparently said that killing was legitimate so that there could be peace and safety, although if attacked by a robber he would fight back without trying to kill his assailant. He apparently

<sup>124</sup> Registre d'inquisition de Jacques Fournier, I, pp. 54; Lambert, Medieval Heresy pp. 159, 161.

<sup>125</sup> *Registre d'inquisition de Jacques Fournier*, I, pp. 54; Lambert, *Medieval Heresy* pp. 159, 161; Shahar, *Women in a Medieval Heretical* Sect, pp. 69-70, 81, 131-4; Cameron, *Waldenses*, p. 85.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> Shahar, *Women in a Medieval Heretical Sect*, pp. 151-3 and see above.

explicitly stated that if 'Manichaeans' (the historian's Cathars) would not be reconciled with the Roman Church, it was legitimate to execute them, but that this should not be applied to Waldensians. However, Biller rules out Raymond's testimony on the basis that it was given under extreme pressure, and that Raymond nonetheless died for a faith inextricably bound to pacifism. Huguette, in the same register, rigidly opposed execution. Indeed, Biller has suggested that this was a gendered issue, with women more opposed, or mentioning it more than men.<sup>126</sup>

# On Purgatory and good works

If we omit the problematic evidence of Bernard of Foucaude, widespread refutation of the doctrine of Purgatory and, logically, prayers and good works for the dead, began only in the inquisitorial era. As Cameron notes, the doctrine of Purgatory was not itself widespread by this period. Inquisitors may have learned of it in the town of Carpentras, but the picture varies. The rejection of Purgatory does not appear to have been as significant in Gascony.<sup>127</sup>

### On the sacraments

The monopoly of the clergy on ritual activity was contested even in the earliest sources such as Alan of Lille and Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay, at least in the case of confession. The sect followed Christ's instruction that believers should confess their sins to each other. According to Alan of Lille, even the earliest Waldensians heard the confessions of believers and denied the validity of penances given by prelates. By the time that the Book of Toulouse was compiled, and in Raymond of Sainte-Foy's group, it seems to have become common practice for adherents to the sect to confess their sins to and even receive penances from more senior Waldensian brothers. Bernard Gui's register reflects

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> Patschovsky and Selge, *Quellen*, pp. 61, 67, as cited in Cameron, *Waldenses*, p.75, and see pp. 84-5; Toulouse ms. 609, f. 249v; Biller, 'Medieval Waldensian abhorrence of killing pre-1400', in *Waldenses*, pp. 81-93, at pp. 84, 89-90; Biller, 'Interrogation of Waldensians', p. 233; Biller, 'The Preaching of the Waldensian sisters'; Taylor, *Heresy, Crusade and Inquisition*, pp. 174, 193; Duvernoy, 'Les Vaudois', pp. 25-6; Shahar, *Women in a Medieval Heretical Sect*, pp. 91-2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup> Patschovsky and Selge, *Quellen*, pp. 61, 63, 66-8, as cited in Cameron, *Waldenses*, pp. 75-6, and see p. 85; Lambert, *Medieval Heresy*, pp. 161, 168.

this also. Cameron suggests that such confidential encounters allowed Waldensians to strengthen their hold on the laity.<sup>128</sup>

Other sacramental roles were eventually either usurped or made irrelevant in the Waldensian schema. Raymond of Sainte-Foy's *majorales* were able to perform the Mass without ordination in the Catholic Church. The ordination ceremony itself which became elaborate also within this group, and Cameron notes its uniqueness and complexity. However, contemporary depositions from Toulouse and Gascony do not reflect this. Other sacramental roles were perhaps eventually either usurped or made irrelevant in the Waldensian schema. However, few Waldensians seem to have come to the position that *only* they could baptise Christians.<sup>129</sup>

### On prayer

Some tenets of belief and practice evolved along different lines in southern France than they did elsewhere. We hear from Bernard of Foucaude that Waldensians in Languedoc refused to pray in churches from an early date. Waldensians in southern France also taught prayers, to Na Sauris of Montcuq and Pérégrine Gasc of Moissac, for example. Raymond of Sainte-Foy's group prayed the Our Father collectively but, unlike other Waldensians, also prayed the Hail Mary. Bernard Gui's register notes evidence from several people that by c.1300 it was Waldensian practice to pray with believers crouched over a bench. The Book of Toulouse also describes this practice, involving the Lord's Prayer, probably in Latin, being recited many times. Mollat suggested that Bernard Gui's knowledge of this manner of praying perhaps derived from the deposition of Raymond of Sainte-Foy, as his account of Waldensian ordination probably did.<sup>130</sup>

<sup>129</sup> Lambert, *Medieval Heresy*, p. 161; Cameron, *Waldenses*, pp. 88-90. Valdes had washed his hands of one such group and they seem to have formed their own church, with clerical ranks within it Lambert, *Medieval Heresy*, pp. 83-4.

<sup>130</sup> Wakefield and Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, p. 213; Duvernoy, *L'inquisition en Quercy*, pp. 106-7; Fonds Doat 22, f. 30r-v; Mollat, *Manuel de l'inquisiteur*, I, p. 53 note 2 and II, p. 149, note 2; Pales-Gobillard, *Le Livre des sentences de l'inquisitor Bernard Gui*, II, pp. 984-7, 1020-1, 1024-5; Cameron, *Waldenses*, p. 83-4, 90.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Wakefield and Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, p. 714 note 37; Duvernoy, *Le register de Jacques Fournier*, I, pp. 70-2, 78; *Le Livre des sentences de l'inquisitor Bernard Gui*, II, pp. 1042-3. See also Cameron, *Waldenses*, pp. 72-3, 83.

# On Easter rituals

We have abundant evidence of the particular place of the Easter rituals in the religiosity of southern French Waldensians. This included the mass on Easter Day. Na Coutes told Peter Seilan about how they preached on Easter day, and heard confessions and administered penances.<sup>131</sup> The practice of blessing and eating bread and fish on Maundy Thursday to celebrate the Last Supper, the Cene, was probably unique to southern France. From the 1230s at the latest, Waldensians in Quercy did this, as Christ had commanded. Of the approximately one hundred and sixty-five people who admitted contact with Waldensians at Montauban, thirty had either helped at the Waldensian celebration of the Last Supper, or had eaten at this festival. Pons de la Jonguière of Montauban, for example, had assisted at the ritual and eaten and drunk bread and wine blessed by them at it. Pierre de la Barrière had assisted at this ceremony on two occasions, eating fish and bread and wine blessed by them. The Maundy Thursday celebration later included the washing of celebrants' feet by the majoralis, as well as still involving fish, blessed bread and wine. The Supper was still being celebrated in c.1300, by the majoral to Raymond of Sainte-Foy's group, and apparently also at Montaillou. However, it was done more secretively. Raymond of Sainte-Foy suggested that only the priests and deacons took part in a ritual enacted by the majorialis, but that these meals were kept secret from followers of the sect.132

#### 8. Organisation and structure

Cameron notes of the southern French that they 'formed a simple, travelling society, without any elaborate administrative hierarchy, and with quite simple teachings and few rituals'. Nonetheless the sect was structured in ranks, and there was a clear distinction between the brothers and sisters themselves and their supporters. Furthermore, it appears to have become increasingly highly structured. Raymond of Sainte-Foy's evidence reveals a complex organisation, with deacons, such as himself, ministers (*majorales*) such as John of Lorraine who ordained him in c.1300, and between

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> Duvernoy, *L'inquisition*, pp. 144-5; Duvernoy, 'Les Vaudois', pp. 22-4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> Duvernoy, L'inquisition, pp. 128-9, 168-9; Duvernoy, Le register de Jacques Fournier, I, p. 72; III, p.
919; Lambert, Medieval Heresy, p. 159; Taylor, Heresy Crusade and Inquisition, p. 11; Cameron, Waldenses, pp. 77, 90.

them, priests. Deacons had to study and prepare for up to six years before being ordained, and did not perform rituals but concerned themselves with more practical matters.<sup>133</sup>

### Waldensians in the Christian community

#### Learning

Abundant evidence undermines the claims of Catholic clergy such as Alan of Lille that Waldensians were uneducated. In fact, Waldensians were well educated, but in the vernacular. The brothers and sisters attended the sect's schools, learning Scripture in the vernacular for several years before being allowed to preach. In Peter Seilan's register we hear that James Carbonnel 'went to their schools frequently and read with them'. Pons Séguy had also read their books. Biller in particular has highlighted the extent of the Waldensian production and use of books. He notes from Jacques Fournier's register, an account of a Waldensian reading the gospel in the vernacular in a house near Saint-Saturnin at Toulouse, which he held in both hands. Furthermore, their works were valued widely, and Waldensian vernacular Bibles may well have been used by Cathars and by other people. There is evidence from the 1240s indicating this in Quercy. There is significant evidence for women's education. In 1244, for example, a deponent told the inquisitors Ferrer and Peter Durant that the sisters read out the Athanasian creed and the Gospel of St. John at the bedside of a sick person.<sup>134</sup>

### Wandering and Preaching

Itinerancy and preaching were as much a part of the Waldensian life in southern France as they were elsewhere. The two activities were inextricably linked, and clergy took issue with both. Once it was decided that an aspiring preacher was educated and ready, they were called to the confess their sins, and this was followed by recitation and examination of passages of scripture in the vernacular, which they had learned by heart. Only then did the wandering life began. However, this may not have been the case early on. The manner of the Poor Catholics' rejection of itinerancy perhaps implies that the wandering lifestyle was common to uneducated as well as educated brothers and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> Cameron, Waldenses, pp. 73 (quotation), 77-8; Lambert, Medieval Heresy, p. 159.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> Duvernoy, *L'inquisition*, pp. 132-3, 200-1; Léglu, Rist and Taylor, *The Cathars*, pp. 167 and 169 note 3; Duvernoy, *Le register de Jacques Fournier*, I, p. 512; Biller, 'The topos and reality of the heretic as illitteratus', in *Waldenses*, pp. 170-90; Biller, 'The Preaching of the Waldensian sisters', p. 138; Taylor, *Heresy, Crusade and Inquisition*, p. 191.

sisters: 'If a lay person wishes to conform to our suggestions, we recommend that, other than those suitable for preaching and disputing with the heretics, the rest should remain in th[eir] houses, leading a religious and well-ordered life, distributing their own goods with justice and mercy, and working with their hands'. Followers were often recruited through preaching.<sup>135</sup>

Waldensian public preaching evidently went underground to a degree from 1209, but this shift should not be overstated. They did not immediately resort to preaching at private events. The deponent Michael Verger of Avignonnet recalled their door-to-door preaching against Catharism in c.1216-c.1220.<sup>136</sup> In the 1240s Peter Austorgue noted that Waldensians had preached along roadsides.<sup>137</sup> Indeed, their existing itinerancy perhaps protected them, for they were able to preach, and then move on. We should not forget that Waldensians were most concerned with preaching against Cathars, not Catholics. They do not seem to have been opposed the preaching of clergy, even in Latin. Nonetheless, this gave the brothers and sisters an opening and an opportunity to engage them. Indeed, Raymond of Sainte-Foy said the clergy should certainly preach, as long as his sect could then do likewise.<sup>138</sup>

# Disputation and debate

In 1204, when the Dominicans established a preaching mission against Cathars in Languedoc, debating with both groups of heretics was an important part of this.<sup>139</sup> The debate at Pamiers in 1207 was pivotal in the history of the sect, as we have seen. But just as was the case with Waldensian preaching, debating in southern France was heavily focussed on undermining Cathars. William of Puylaurens tells us that 'Waldensians used to engage in vigorous disputation with the

<sup>136</sup> Ms 609, f. 136r; Brenon, 'Vaudoisie en Languedoc', p. 123.

<sup>137</sup> Duvernoy, *L'inquisition*, pp. 138-9; Taylor, *Heresy, Crusade and Inquisition*, p. 29.

<sup>138</sup> See Duvernoy, 'Les Vaudois', pp. 26-7.

<sup>139</sup> On debates, see Sackville, *Heresy and Heretics in the Thirteenth Century*, esp. pp. 22-4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> Caterina Bruschi's work underlines itinerant proselytising as typifying most high-medieval heresy, not only Waldensianism: *Wandering Heretics*, pp. 100-141, esp. 107, 113, 114-15 (quotation), 121-3, 130. See also Cameron, *Waldenses*, p. 15 and Lambert, *Medieval Heresy*, p. 81.

other sects'.<sup>140</sup> The ex-Waldensian Bernard Prim had engaged the Cather *perfectus* Isarn de Castres in debate at Laurac in 1208.<sup>141</sup> The key areas under discussion in c.1200 were probably the uniqueness or otherwise of God, the nature of Creation, fallen angels, Mosaic law, and the resurrection of the dead.<sup>142</sup>

The Quercy documentation also provides evidence of this dynamic process. There, disputations seem to have usually taken place at Montauban, where there were most Waldensians. The evidence is abundant. Peter Bacou of Montauban assisted Waldensians in a dispute with Cathars. The brothers Raymond, James and William Carbonnel helped to arrange such events. The priest Francis admitted having assisted in a debate between Waldensians and Cathars. He considered the latter to be good people, but he had also heard Waldensians preach in the castle of Montcuq. At Gourdon, Pana, had allowed *perfecti* and Waldensians to dispute in her house.<sup>143</sup>

#### Material support

Waldensian followers in southern France supported the sect in a material sense, as they did elsewhere, because the brothers and sisters followed Christ's exhortation to preach and not to worry about economic security. Alan of Lille noted at the start of our period that they lived from the work of their *auditores*. A hundred years later, Raymond of Sainte-Foy's modest household was supported by the carpenter's labour. More commonly, Waldensians lived off donations of moveable goods – almost always food and clothes. We find a great deal of evidence about what this support might mean in practice, and thereby about economic and social life more generally. There are manifold examples from witnesses from Quercy in 1241-2.<sup>144</sup> Later, Peter of Les Barthes said that Galharda Bruna of Castres had persuaded him to give her half a quarter of corn, which she would pass on to two women (who, he found out only later, were Waldensians). These were perhaps the

<sup>142</sup> Thouzellier, *Hérésie et hérétiques*, pp. 81-165.

<sup>143</sup> Duvernoy, L'inquisition, pp. 68-9, 102-3, 128-9, 132-3, 168-9; Léglu et al., The Cathars, p. 140;
 Taylor, Heresy, Crusade and Inquisition, pp. 131, 135, 156, 197-8.

<sup>144</sup> See Taylor, *Heresy, Crusade and Inquisition*, esp. pp. 171-7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> *The Chronicle of William of Puylaurens*, p. 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>141</sup> MS 609, f. 198r; Thouzellier, *Catharisme et Valdéisme*, p. 232.

two sisters captured at Castres. They had also been given corn and 'a lump of meat' by Bernard of St. Martin. Peter Martini, a lord of Viviers, had his herdsman Raymond Biat give Waldensians a quarter of corn for three years running. John Cochafieu had given two Waldensian brothers who were staying with him, a shirt and some grapes. Sibille de Lagarde's mother had ordained before she died that her daughter should pass on some of her belongings to them.<sup>145</sup>

However, there is good evidence that southern French Waldensians in fact held and controlled both property and money collectively, at least in the central and later decades of the thirteenth century. They raised it from supporters through voluntary taxes and having it bequeathed in wills. At Montauban, Raimond Carbonnel's brother Jacques pressed him into leaving them two hundred *solidi* in his will. Cahorsin Cabatier gave them money.<sup>146</sup> However, at the end of the century, a more fundamentalist approach had been revived. Raymond of Sainte-Foy referred explicitly to Matthew 6: 28-31 in this context. His group took a vow of poverty which extended even to not holding communal funds or property, the only exception being that they could carry food with them when they travelled.<sup>147</sup> Indeed, Huguette of Pamiers confessed to James Fournier that she had offered the Waldensian Jean of Lorraine two pieces of silver, to support him. He had refused and said he did not carry money, and she indeed saw that there was none in his purse.<sup>148</sup>

#### Curing the sick.

In spite of another general prohibition, Waldensians in Quercy did sometimes work with their hands. As noted above, the Waldensian Toulza of Lavaur helped to build the church of Saint-Nauphary. But the most common occupation for the heretics in Quercy that of doctors. Biller shows that the sect was rather cornering the market in Quercy, in spite of there being a wider, orthodox hospital movement in the south more widely.<sup>149</sup> Pons de la Jonquière of Montauban spoke of a Waldensian hospital, which he had visited often. More typically, patients seem to have been visited in their

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>145</sup> Biller, 'Interrogations of Waldensians', pp. 232, 233.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>146</sup> Duvernoy, *L'inquisition*, pp. 154-5; Léglu, Rist and Taylor, *The Cathars*, p. 140.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>147</sup> Duvernoy, 'Les Vaudois', p. 24; Cameron, *Waldenses*, p. 88; Lambert, *Medieval Heresy*, pp. 158-9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>148</sup> Shahar, *Women in a Medieval Heretical Sect*, p. 147.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> 'Curate infirmos: the medieval Waldensian practice of medicine', in his *The Waldenses*, pp. 49-67.

homes. Among numerous examples, Guillemette Faidit, wife of Pons Faucaire, had Waldensians treat her sick son. When Rom of Sapiac's son and wife were ill, such doctors were consulted. Arnaud-Bernard de Rouzet admitted that a Waldensian woman had washed his head, perhaps treating an infection or infestation.<sup>150</sup>

Perhaps this was not regarded by the southern French as the sort of labour which the sect in general prohibited. It is very possibly the case that they were observing Jesus' exhortation to cure the sick. It is also possible that the doctors treated some supporters without charge. Nonetheless, typical references in the Quercy depositions reveal doctors visiting and treating patients in exchange for goods, usually food. Géraude Coutes, who had called in Waldensian doctors many times to her sick son, and as was often the case, she gave them food as payment. Guillaume Géraud, son of Hugues Géraud, had Waldensian doctors treat his illness in exchange for goods.<sup>151</sup>

Furthermore, plenty of people who employed Waldensians for treatment were not otherwise involved with the sect. There are fourteen individuals in Doat 21 who encountered both heretical groups, but in the case of Waldensians, it was only in a medical context. Jean Touzet, for example, received the *consolamentum* from Cathars at Villemur, yet consulted Waldensian doctors when ill. Raimond Touzet consulted them when he injured his hand, but it was Cathars to whom he related in ritual terms. A woman called Algée served and submitted to Cathars and had extensive involvement in their day-to-day life, but when she became ill, it was to Waldensians that she turned. Faïs de Sapiac declared that she did not believe in either the Cathar or Waldensian faiths, but had consulted the latter when sick.<sup>152</sup> Pragmatism was shown in this matter by both the ordinary laity and the Waldensians.

By far the most significant Waldensian doctor was Peter of Vals. He is in fact the most significant Waldensian of any sort emerging from the Quercy documentation. At Gourdon, Pana, loved him 'like an angel from God'. Three women of the seigneurial family at Goulême – Gaillarde, Alice, Raymonde and Wilma had consulted him over illnesses, in Raymonde's case that of her maidservant. Bertrande of Braulèns had received him in her home to cure her sick son. Bernarde Roux of Gourdon had done

<sup>152</sup> Duvernoy, *L'inquisition en Quercy*, pp. 130-1, 132-3, 190-1, 206-7; Léglu, Rist and Taylor, *The Cathars*, p. 140.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>150</sup> Duvernoy, *L'inquisition*, pp. 158-9, 188-9, 192-3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>151</sup> Duvernoy, *L'inquisition*, pp. 124-5.

the same, and gave him food. Furthermore, he was paid in cash by Pierre de la Chapelle when his wife was sick, having charged him twenty pennies for two visits.<sup>153</sup>

It would appear to have been the case that treating the sick was not regarded as working with the hands *per se*, and was therefore allowed to Waldensians. It was important to Waldensians in Quercy, at least, for it brought them into the most intimate of situations with followers and formed strong bonds between them. It perhaps brought a degree of anonymity too. Cameron suggests that the activity gave Waldensians an excuse for travelling.<sup>154</sup> As with their preaching and ministering activity it did not go entirely underground in the inquisitorial era. Lambert is surely correct to suggest for southern France that, 'In effect, Waldensians had become an unrecognised order of itinerant friars, carefully selected, living and travelling in secrecy, sustaining the use of the vernacular Scriptures, maintaining a disciplined and moral life yet unable to break out, preach and recruit openly'.<sup>155</sup>

### 9. Conclusion

Given the marginalisation and persecution which they were evidently experienced, it seems remarkable that Waldensians in southern France did not become more disillusioned with the clerical authority than they did. Not only were the southern French not Donatist, they were not even particular anti-clerical. As Cameron puts it, 'It was the authority of a persecuting Church, not its moral stature or its sacramental services, which the heretics denied'.<sup>156</sup> As such, their initial success in the already heretical Languedoc, may not have been because of their heresy, but because of their orthodoxy.

This may also have been their undoing. Cameron suggests various reasons for their decline. Their rejection of the more radical anti-clericalism of groups in Italy perhaps meant that they did not really have a place in an increasingly polarised Languedoc. Once they began to be seriously persecuted, they may not have had the appeal that they did when they occupied a middle ground between

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>153</sup> Duvernoy, *L'inquisition*, pp. 32-3, 36-7, 38-9, 62-3, 64-5, 68-9, 74-5, 84-5; Taylor, *Heresy, Crusade and Inquisition*, esp. pp. 166-7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>154</sup> Cameron, *Waldenses*, p. 73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>155</sup> Lambert, *Medieval Heresy*, p. 160.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>156</sup> Cameron, *Waldenses*, p. 85.

unpopular aspects of Catholicism and outright heresy. The sect was too orthodox to remain distinct and was 'perhaps too nuanced, too close to orthodoxy, for it to keep an independent position for long'. Equally, the social dislocation wrought by inquisition, if not the arrests and executions themselves, must have undermined their basis of support just as it did Cathars. Certainly, inquisition and the fear of capture put pressure on them.<sup>157</sup>

But we should not write Waldensians out of southern French history too soon. In Quercy, Lambert suggests that families containing Waldensians were still in evidence at Montauban in 1270, witnessing a royal endowment to the Poor Clares, and of the Waldensians burned by Jacques Fournier, two originated in Quercy, at Castelsarrasin. Refugees from the inquests at Toulouse were in the Pyrenees and in Aragon in 1344. The *Liber Electorum* (Book of the Chosen), a brief history composed by a Waldensian in Italy between 1335 and 1350, survives in the southern French vernacular, Occitan, as well as in Latin.<sup>158</sup>

How should we regard the southern French Waldensians in terms of Waldensianism more widely? It is tempting to see them as marginal, but this is only in relation to Catharism. Had there been no Cathars in southern France, Waldensians might have been both more successful and more visible for the sorts of reasons they had been at Lyon. On the other hand, had there been no Cathars, then Waldensians may not have been drawn to the region in the first place. Without Cathars, there would perhaps have been no inquisition neither, and we would have few if any records of them. The inquisitorial depositions hold enormous potential and allow us to read behind the polemical and chronicle evidence, sometimes adding to it, sometimes contradicting it. The examples above merely scratch the surface, as does the historiography. There is data enough for a significant monograph to be written addressing the sect in Languedoc on its own terms and doing it full justice, building on the existing editions of relevant sources, the partly speculative comparisons and contrasts with the Poor Catholics which have traditionally accompanied them, the relatively substantial sections in works on heresy and Waldensians more generally, and the many important thematic articles on their nature and activity.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>157</sup> Cameron, Waldenses, pp. 70, 87 (quotation), 95.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>158</sup> Lambert, *Medieval Heresy*, p. 163; Shahar, *Women in a Medieval Heretical* Sect, pp. viii n. 3, 78;
Biller, P., 'The *Liber Electorum*' in *idem. Waldenses*, pp. 207-224.